

**Evolution of Saskatchewan's Recruitment, Employment and Immigration
Policies for International Students within the Context of Canadian Federalism**

Kim Assailly

**A Thesis Submitted to the College of
Graduate Studies and Research
in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements
for the Degree of Masters of Arts
in the Department of Political Studies**

**University of Saskatchewan
Saskatoon**

© *Copyright Kim Assailly, April 2012. All rights reserved.*

Permission to Use

In presenting this thesis/dissertation in partial fulfillment of the requirements for a Postgraduate degree from the University of Saskatchewan, I agree that the Libraries of this University may make it freely available for inspection. I further agree that permission for copying of this thesis/dissertation in any manner, in whole or in part, for scholarly purposes may be granted by the professor or professors who supervised my thesis/dissertation work or, in their absence, by the Head of the Department or the Dean of the College in which my thesis work was done. It is understood that any copying or publication or use of this thesis/dissertation or parts thereof for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission. It is also understood that due recognition shall be given to me and to the University of Saskatchewan in any scholarly use which may be made of any material in my thesis/dissertation.

Requests for permission to copy or to make other uses of materials in this thesis/dissertation in whole or part should be addressed to:

Head of the Department of Political Studies
University of Saskatchewan
9 Campus Drive
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan
Canada S7N 5A5

OR

Dean
College of Graduate Studies and Research
University of Saskatchewan
107 Administration Place
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan
Canada S7N 5A2

Acknowledgements

Throughout my experience as a student both undergraduate and graduate I have been honoured with the support and of many individuals.

First and foremost I would like to thank my academic supervisor Dr. Joseph Garcea, who provided a learning experience for me that went beyond what was required. His guidance was invaluable in the development of my thesis.

I would also like to thank my committee members Dr Neil Hibbert, Dr. Mobinul Huq and a special thanks to Roy Romanow for enhancing my learning journey with his experience and passion for various policy issues facing Canada. I also greatly appreciated the significant effort Dr. Hans Michelman put into the coordination of the graduate program.

In addition to several impactful professors, I was lucky to have interesting and decent individuals in my graduate cohort, which I have developed significant friendships with.

I would like to thank my family and friends for providing the foundation that helped me along throughout my studies. Firstly, my father Eugene Assailly for planting the seed of the importance of education at a young age. Secondly, my mother Karen Assailly for assisting me in countless ways to ensure my success and my sister Rae Assailly for encouraging me to achieve my career goals. Last but not least my partner Jason Villeneuve for respecting the importance of education in my life and adding some fun to it.

Dedication

I would like to dedicate this thesis to Karen Assailly and Stan Ferguson, my mother and late grandfather. Through two generations they embodied respectability, strength, and commitment to family and community. I can only hope these traits have continued to my generation.

Abstract

This thesis provides an understanding of the multitude of socio-economic factors and motivations that impinged on the Saskatchewan government's decisions for creating policies for the retention of international students as immigrants. The state-centric and political economy perspectives are used to assist in understanding the complex interplay between these factors and motivations in the context of the federal nature of the Canadian policy making environment.

The analysis demonstrates that the emphasis on recruitment and retention of international students is not unique to Saskatchewan. International students possess the attributes that are desired in an immigrant because of their proficiency in at least one of the official languages, they have Canadian post-secondary education, and they are acclimated to life in Canada/Saskatchewan. Given the existing and emerging skilled labour shortages globally, the competition for skilled labour is intensifying and international students represent part of the solution to the problem. Secondly, the analysis demonstrates that the relationships between the federal and provincial governments and the constitution governing them, has impacted the policy outcomes regarding international students. Almost all policies have emerged out of a federal-provincial agreement or a memorandum of understanding.

This thesis reveals that the growing number of international students in the province's post-secondary institutions is partly a function of a concerted effort to make Saskatchewan an education destination. The provincial government is hoping to continue to increase the levels through marketing and strategic partnerships. Similar to countries like the United States, United Kingdom and Australia, the federal government has recognized the financial and social benefits, and is also making a significant investment in branding and marketing Canada as an attractive place to study and work.

In addition to growing enrolment, the province is also providing opportunities for international graduates to stay in the province after they graduate. The Saskatchewan Provincial Nominee Program's student category plays an integral role in the retention of international students post-graduation. In addition to creating immigration opportunities for international graduates, the Saskatchewan and Canadian governments have also eased the restrictions on employment for students while studying and post-graduation. Moreover, the Saskatchewan government has extended some tax benefits to international students if they work in the province after completing their studies.

The thesis concludes that despite potential drawbacks, such as the brain drain experienced by the sending countries and the potential impact on Aboriginal Peoples involvement in the labour market, Saskatchewan and Canada will likely continue along the path of recruiting international students and providing them opportunities after they graduate, not only to stay and work but also to immigrate to the province.

Table of Contents

Permission to Use.....	i
Acknowledgements.....	ii
Dedication.....	iii
Abstract.. ..	iv
Table of Contents.....	v
Chapter 1 – Introduction.....	1
1.1 Focus of Thesis.....	1
1.2 Research Objectives and Questions.....	1
1.3 Theoretical Perspectives.....	2
1.3.1 State-centric vs. Socio-centric Perspective.....	2
1.3.2 Political Economy Perspectives.....	5
1.4 Impact of Globalization.....	7
1.5 Evolution of Federal-Provincial Negotiations and Agreements on Immigration.....	8
1.6 Thesis Organization.....	12
Chapter 2 – International Student Policies in Comparative Context.....	13
2.1 Impetus and Imperatives for Developing International Student Policies.....	14
2.2 International Student Policies in Selected Countries: Comparative Overview.....	16
2.2.1 Australia’s Policy Approach.....	16
2.2.2 United Kingdom’s Policy Approach.....	17
2.2.3 United States’ Policy Approach.....	18
2.3 Evolution of Canadian Federal Policies.....	19
2.4 Provincial Policy Development Timelines.....	24
2.5 Secondary Policies Affecting International Students.....	24
2.6 Role of Educational Institutions.....	26
Chapter 3 – Saskatchewan’s Policy Evolution.....	29
3.1 Saskatchewan’s Political and Economic Environment.....	29
3.2 International Student Policy Evolution.....	29
3.3 Political and Public Reaction to the Policies.....	32
3.4 Similarities and Differences Among the Provinces.....	37
Chapter 4 – Conclusion.....	43
4.1 Summary of the Emergence and Evolution of Saskatchewan’s Policy.....	43
4.2 Factors that Shaped Saskatchewan’s Policies.....	44
4.3 Observations of the Advantages and Disadvantages of the Policies.....	47
4.4 Areas for Further Research.....	49
Appendix A- Student Flows at the Post-Secondary Level in Saskatchewan 2001-2010.....	52
Appendix B – Saskatchewan Immigrant Nominee Program Student Category Nominations.....	53
Appendix C – Timeline of Federal-Provincial Relations in Immigration.....	54
Appendix D – Provincial Timelines of Development of Student Categories.....	55
Bibliography.....	56

Chapter 1

Introduction

1.1 Focus of Thesis

The young, the bright, the educated, these are all attributes considered synonymous with international students, who have become a desirable population for immigration in Saskatchewan and Canada, as well as numerous other countries. The Canadian Experience Class, Post-Graduation Work Permit, Student Category, and Off-Campus Work Permit are examples of recent policies created by federal and provincial governments to attract and retain international students. These calculated and targeted policies were the spawn of a greater movement within Canada and internationally to create competitive immigration policies. However, the form that these policies took, within Canada, both federally and provincially was impacted by the complex interplay between and among levels of government. This is illustrated by the variation in provincial international student policies and timelines, which are embodied in their respective federal-provincial agreements. In this thesis it will become evident how various political and economic factors, as well as the alignment of jurisdictional authority, have influenced the interests of the federal and provincial governments in policies related to international students.

1.2 Research Objectives and Questions

The central objective of this thesis is fivefold: to analyze the factors that led Saskatchewan to adopt international student attraction, employment, and immigration policies; the progression of the development of the policies; the political environment from which these policies emerged; the key provisions of these policies that impinge on students; and the value or merits of policy approaches. In examining Saskatchewan's policy special attention is devoted to the federal-provincial negotiations. A full appreciation of how Canada and Saskatchewan's international student policies have developed requires an understanding of the effects of federalism on policy making, and its particular importance in a field of shared jurisdiction such as immigration over time. For this reason, the political and policy legacies of federal-provincial relations in the field of immigration since 1867 are explored. Nevertheless, some attention is also devoted to the policies of other provinces, the federal government and other countries. The reason for this is that an understanding of Saskatchewan's policy requires an appreciation of the

national and international contexts in which the need for competitive immigration policy has evolved. One of the challenges in attracting and retaining international students is that provincial and federal policies may not always complement one another.¹ For example the federal government's ability to attract students to study in Canada is impacted if the provinces do not support lower tuition fees. Also, additional policies both governmental and non-governmental impact the attraction and retention of students. Although the central focus of this thesis is on policies related to the recruitment, employment, and immigration of international students, it is important to recognize that the attraction and retention of international students is also affected by these additional policies related to student fees, student services, and student employment. Thus, in keeping with the foregoing objectives, the research questions for this thesis are:

1. Why has Saskatchewan developed an international students' immigration policy?
2. How did the policies in selected jurisdictions impact the development of Saskatchewan's policies?
3. What are the key elements of Saskatchewan's policies?
4. What are the values or merits of Saskatchewan's policy approach?

1.3 Theoretical Perspectives

In answering most, if not all, of those research questions, this thesis is influenced primarily by the state-centric perspective. Recognizing, however, that governments operate in international and domestic political and economic contexts, not vacuums. This thesis also relies on a political economy perspective that takes into account the relationship of political and economic factors, which impact the capacity of the federal and provincial governments to advance their interests. The basic features of the state-centric and political economy perspectives, along with their relevance to the Canadian policy making experience are explained in turn below.

1.3.1 State-centric vs. Socio-centric Perspective

Alan Cairns has articulated the state-centric perspective.² A full understanding of Cairn's state-centric perspective, which emphasizes the centrality of the interests of the federal and provincial governments in explaining the determinants of public policy initiatives, requires a brief comparison and contrast with the socio-centric, or if you will, the sociological perspective.

¹ Karen McBride, *A Warm Welcome? Recruitment and Admission of International Students to Canadian Universities: Policies, Procedures and Capacity*, Case Studies (Ottawa: Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada, 1998).

² Alan C Cairns, "The Governments and Societies of Canadian Federalism," *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 10, no. 4 (1977): 695-725.

Donald Smiley who juxtaposed Cairn's state-centric perspective with William Livingston's socio-centric perspective has done this comparison most cogently. Livingston articulated that federalism was more of a "sociological phenomenon" and less about constitutions.³ He sought to emphasize the impact of elements such as the electorate, class structures, or pressure groups on the shifts in the federal-provincial balance of power. Livingston insisted on emphasizing the societal cleavages such as language, industry, culture etc to explain the various interests within a federal state. Although Livingston recognized the importance of constitutions and other federal institutions within a federal state he described them as "instrumentalities." In summary, Livingston accounts for all of the territorial divisions within a federal state such as Canada through social diversity.⁴

A second article comparing the sociological and state-centric perspectives by Lori Thorlakson described the sociological approach as limiting the scope of federalism to "constitutional diffusion of power along territorial lines" but also involving the various societal cleavages.⁵ According to Thorlakson the sociological perspective is based upon the assumption that the territorial divisions within a federation can be artificial if they do not match with the societal cleavages. The most significant limitation of the sociological perspective, according to Thorlakson, is that it possesses no explanation for federal states that do not have significant social cleavages.⁶ The State-centric perspective as articulated by Cairns, is an alternative avenue to explain the various policy interests of provinces, which is more of an institutional perspective. Cairns argued that the socio-centric perspective could not adequately explain the rise in provincial power, because it left out the impact of the political system and the role of strong provincial leaders.⁷ Smiley also concluded that the socio-centric perspective is unable to explain the assertiveness of provinces other than Quebec and the lack of a homogenous society from the west. For example, the provincial economies of the west have diversified away from grain into things like uranium, potash, and petroleum – therefore diminishing the shared interests.⁸

³ Donald Smiley, "Federal States and Federal Societies with Special Reference to Canada," *International Political Science Review* (International Political Science Association) 5, no. 4 (1984): 443.

⁴ Smiley, 443.

⁵ Lori Thorlakson, "Government Building and Political Development in Federations: Applying Canadian theory to the German Case," *Regional and Federal Studies* 10, no. 3 (2000): 129-148. Lori Thorlakson, "Government Building and Political Development in Federations: Applying Canadian theory to the German Case," *Regional and Federal Studies* 10, no. 3 (2000): 129.

⁶ Thorlakson, 131.

⁷ Smiley, 445.

⁸ Smiley, 447

Alan Cairns described the various interests and relations between the levels of governments in Canada when he stated:

“Federal and Provincial governments are not neutral containers, or reflecting mirrors, but aggressive actors steadily extending their tentacles of control, regulation, and manipulation into society-playing, in Deutsch’s terminology, a steering role- thus fostering sets of integrated relationships between themselves and the various socioeconomic forces and interests in their jurisdictions.”⁹

As Cairns highlights in this metaphorical quote, Canadian governments are continuously advancing several major interrelated sets of interests. The first set consists of their policy or programmatic interests. Governments engage in policy initiatives that will advance their respective policy or program goals and objectives. Generally, those goals and objectives are focused on improving economic and societal conditions. The economic objectives of governments have been major drivers in immigration policy making in Canada, and therefore international student policies. For example, most provinces have interests in immigration to fill labour shortages that exist within their jurisdictions to sustain economic development. The second set consists of broad political interests such as advancing a particular political identity or achieving a particular degree of autonomy or sovereignty. For the federal government immigration policy has significant impacts on national identity and belonging. This link between immigration and a federal government is articulated by American academic Adam Luedtke who noted that the management of immigration policy “can ultimately define who the nation is, and by doing so can challenge deeply-held norms regarding the nature of belonging to a nation (culture, language etc.).”¹⁰ Among the provinces the interest in protecting and defining political identity is most evident in the case of Quebec, but is also present in other provinces, territories and Aboriginal governments. The third set consists of what may be termed political legitimacy interests. Generally, governments are intent on maximizing their legitimacy as governments both in their own right and vis-à-vis other governments within the context of the Canadian political system. The fourth set consists of their electoral interests, which usually guide federal and provincial governments to engage in policy initiatives that are likely to advance their electoral interests.

⁹ Cairns, 706.

¹⁰ Adam Luedtke, "Citizenship, Economics, and Immigration in a Federal Polity: Evidence from Canada and the EU," *Centre d'études canadiennes* (University of Washington , December 2004)7.

The multiplicity of federal and provincial interests has necessitated striking a balance between their respective goals and objectives.¹¹ Achieving a balance is complicated by the fact that the motivations and objectives of the various provinces are not homogenous. In the field of immigration, for example, Quebec must consider several of its interests, including economic development, its demographics (i.e, size, distribution, and age of the population), as well as its cultural and linguistic preservation.¹² In the other provinces principal focus is on their economic development and demographic interests. For example, within the realm of immigration, most provinces have been influenced primarily by economic development considerations, but some (Saskatchewan and Manitoba) have also been motivated by their demographic interests. During the past few decades, concern exists among some provinces about drawing their share of immigrants needed to advance their respective interests. Thus it has been argued that increased provincial control over immigrant selection in the West is needed to combat the disparity in immigrant flows.¹³ Invariably, efforts to achieve a balance between various provincial interests include combinations of cooperation, conflict, and compromise in most policy areas.¹⁴

1.3.2 Political Economy Perspectives

To reiterate, although the interests of governments are key factors in explaining policy initiatives of the federal and provincial governments within the federal system, governments do not operate in a vacuum. They operate in evolving domestic and international political and economic contexts in which political and economic factors impinge on their policy interests and initiatives. Those contexts influence not only the policy initiatives of the federal and provincial governments, but also the alignment of roles and responsibilities between them.

In their book Michael Howlett and M. Ramesh have highlighted the influence of the domestic political economy cogently.¹⁵ The authors define the actors in the political economy as “the specific mix of state and market institutions found within a nation-state.”¹⁶ In explaining the domestic political economy context, invariably they point to several key factors but in particular the structural features of the political and economic systems and the key interests of the most

¹¹ Ian Peach, *Constructing Tomorrows Federalism: New Perspectives on Canadian Governance* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2007)3.

¹² Luedtke, 2.

¹³ Jason J.Azmier, Vien Huynh, and Kristine Molin. “Increasing Western Canadian Immigration” *Building the New West* (Calgary: Canada West Foundation, 2004) 1.

¹⁴ Christopher Leo and Martine August, "The Multilevel Governance of Immigration and Settlement: Making Deep Federalism Work," *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 42, no. 2 (June 2009) 492.

¹⁵ Michael Howlett and M Ramesh, *The Political Economy of Canada* (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc, 1992).

¹⁶ Howlett & Ramesh, 10.

prominent and influential actors within those systems. This includes the federated nature of the political system, the diverse nature of the economic systems of each region and province, and the diversity of competing and collaborating interests of state and societal actors. Howlett and Ramesh also describe the germaneness of political economy perspective in understanding how Canada's federal system functions, "the study of political economy reveals a great deal about how a particular society or an international regime operates." In the case of Canada, Howlett and Ramesh use the term "divided sovereignty" to help describe the significance of the division of powers between the federal and provincial governments for the political economy analysis. For example "within a federal system, it makes a great deal of difference whether the central government or the state government control important areas such as banking, social insurance, or labour law; this control will help determine which interests and actors are involved in the policy process."¹⁷ Thus, determining which actors have most impact helps us to understand policy outcomes.

The political economy theory has several broad perspectives contained in it to help dissect the "relationship between states and markets found within and among nation states."¹⁸ Those most commonly used in analyzing Canadian federalism are the Liberal, Marxist or neo-Marxist perspectives. This thesis is informed by the Liberal political economy perspective, which is focused on the structural features of Canadian federal system. The perspective places importance on the federal and provincial governments as instrumental actors in operating within the federalism system, rather than the modes of production in a capitalist system and the classes or class-fractions therein as suggested by the Marxist and Neo-Marxist perspectives.¹⁹ From the liberals perspective the need for the division of powers between the two levels of government is in part to provide checks and balances so that no single government has absolute control over policies which impact the individual.²⁰ Ultimately, both the political economy and state centric perspectives compliment one another to provide a basis for understanding the intricacies of Canada's federal environment relating to immigration policies. The latter perspective is important because it views federalism from a lens that emphasizes interests of provincial governments and the political actors themselves. The liberal political economy perspective is

¹⁷ Howlett and Ramesh, 161.

¹⁸ Howlett and Ramesh, 11.

¹⁹ Howlett and Ramesh, 26

²⁰ Howlett and Ramesh, 26

important tool in understanding policy outcomes, because it includes the non-political factors that impact federalism and the role of the division of power.

1.4 Impact of Globalization

Although the interests of governments are key factors in explaining policy initiatives within the context of Canadian federalism, the governments operate in evolving political and economic contexts both at the global and at the domestic level. Trends such as urbanization and globalization influence not only the policy initiatives of the federal and provincial governments, but also alignment of roles and responsibilities between them. The former is attributable to the growing population and economic importance of cities.²¹ Thomas Courchene has examined the shift in the alignment of roles and responsibilities as a result of globalization.²²

He noted that globalization had triggered downward and upward transfers of jurisdictional authority. The upward shift from central governments is to supranational organizations such as the European Union or bilateral trade agreements. The downward shift is to provincial and local governments as national governments become less able to develop and implement national policies. Courchene asserted that a number of policy areas that were previously considered national in nature are being opened up to other levels of government. In addition, Courchene observed that the new global reality of economic interdependence has allowed for more direct relationships between Canadian provincial governments and national and sub-governments in other countries. These relations have contributed to the expansion of the provincial powers.²³ For example, Alberta and Saskatchewan are increasingly participating in trans-border economic relationships, particularly with western U.S. states.²⁴ This need for all levels of governments to be competitive in the integrated global economy necessitates countries that operate in a system of federalism to rethink their structures and divisions of power.²⁵

The points made by Courchene are echoed in an article about the management of immigration in federal countries by Peter J. Spiro, who asserted that globalization opens the door for more involvement of sub-national governments within the realm of immigration. Spiro

²¹ Thomas R Klassen John W.P. Veugelers, "Canadian Immigration Policy: A reply to Foot and Simmons," *The Canadian Journal of Sociology* 19, no. 4 (1994): 537.

²² Thomas J. Courchene, *A State of Minds: Toward a Human Capital Future for Canadians* (Montreal: Insitute for Research in Public Policy, 2001)17.

²³ Peter Spiro, "Federalism and Immigration: models and trends," *International Social Science Journal* 53, no. 167 (2001): 67.

²⁴ Peter J. Meekison, *Canada: The State of the Federation 2002: Reconsidering the Institutions of Canadian Federalism* (Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2004) 23.

²⁵ Howard Leeson, "Alberta/Saskatchewan Transborder Contacts with US States: A Survey and Analysis Revisited," *Canada The State of the Federation 2002: Reconsidering the Institutions of Canadian Federalism*, 2004.

analyzed the shift in responsibility for immigration to sub-national governments in federal states more generally. He cited globalization as one of the factors causing central governments to cede some control over immigration to meet the needs of sub-national governments.²⁶

Although globalization is a significant cause of shifts in roles and responsibilities downwards to provinces in federal states, it has not been the only cause. As discussed earlier in this chapter, the multiple domestic political and economic factors have also been and continue to be significant. This is quite evident in Quebec's ongoing efforts for nearly four decades to increase the scope of its jurisdictional authority and its roles and responsibilities for immigration, which remains a field of shared jurisdiction with federal paramountcy in Canada. This growth in provincial power, despite the lack of a certain diagnosis of its precise causes, allowed for differing provincial policies to develop across many policy domains.

1.5 Evolution of Federal-Provincial Negotiations and Agreements on Immigration

The Canadian provincial governments have become increasingly involved in many policy areas in order to advance the political and economic interests that Alan Cairns was referring to. As discussed above each province has interrelated interests, which are evidenced in their negotiations and the components within the federal-provincial immigration agreements. There have been several distinct periods demonstrating differing types of federal and provincial relations within the realm of immigration. The first was soon after confederation, when the first federal-provincial conference occurred to identify the roles and responsibilities of the governments. A federal-provincial agreement emerged out of this conference in 1868 and identified the federal government's role in establishing immigration offices in Europe, as well as formally allowing provinces to appoint agents abroad.²⁷ The process of assembling a federal-provincial agreement in order to allocate provincial powers in immigration was set during the negotiation of this first immigration agreement, which is still followed over a century later. In the period of time immediately following confederation there were several intergovernmental conferences and agreements, which lasted for approximately six years before the second period began.

The second period was characterized by very little involvement by the provinces in the field of immigration. The federal government decided that the individual actions of the

²⁶ Spiro, 67.

²⁷ Robert Vineberg, "Federal-provincial relations in Canadian immigration," *Canadian Public Administration* 30, no. 20 (1987): 303.

provinces abroad was dividing resources and causing conflict.²⁸ Thus, a federal dominance over immigration policy returned and continued until well after the Second World War, likely because during both world wars immigration became less of a priority for all levels of government. By the 1950's there was a resurgence of immigration levels to Canada and the federal government created the Department of Citizenship and Immigration. The new department took the Immigration policy area out from under the umbrella of the Department of Mines and Resources and signaled its rising importance within the federation. With this increase in immigration levels the provinces became more interested and aware of the importance of immigration for their economies. However, the newly created CIC was not developed with the consideration of provincial interests.

In the 1970's the federal government returned to a more open policy towards provincial involvement. This shift was demonstrated in a policy green paper in 1974 that reevaluated the role of provincial governments in immigration. The green paper stated "Clearly there is no constitutional bar to more active and widened collaboration between the central government and the provinces, the purpose being to make immigration policy more sensitive to the latter."²⁹ Following this policy paper the federal government's immigration act reflected this concept of consultation in areas such as selection and settlement.

After almost a century without any significant intergovernmental immigration agreements, Quebec and the federal government signed the Lang-Cloutier agreement in 1971. The Lang-Cloutier agreement allowed Quebec to establish a presence abroad and resulted in some employees from the federal Immigration Foreign Service switching to work for the Quebec Immigration Service. In comparison to many of the other provinces agreements, the Quebec agreement of 1971 was more extensive with Quebec eventually obtaining a veto over any immigrants into the province.³⁰ Despite Quebec being the first province to establish an agreement with the federal government, the province wasn't always interested in immigration. In early confederation Quebec saw immigration as a threat to the protection of their language and culture. However, by the 1970's Quebec sought to have control over their immigration likely because of economic benefits, in addition to being able to select their own immigrants instead of

²⁸ Vineberg, 302.

²⁹ Department of Manpower and Immigration, *Immigration and Policy Perspectives*. Volume 1 of the Report of the Canadian Immigration and Populations Study.(Ottawa: 1974) 57.

³⁰ Vineberg, 313,314.

the federal government doing it for them.³¹ Saskatchewan followed the path set by Quebec and signed its own agreement with the federal government in 1978. The intergovernmental agreements of the 1970's and 1980's do bind the governments to policy consultation in order to meet labour demands but did not go so far as to establish selection programs.

Within the last two decades Canada has witnessed a marked shift in the responsibility for immigrant selection and integration towards the provinces. This devolution of power has largely played out through the proliferation federal-provincial agreements across all provinces. The most recent round of federal-provincial agreements have developed provincial nominee programs, which enable the provinces to select their own immigrants. Quebec, once again taking the lead signed another agreement in 1991 with the federal government, granting the province control over selection and federal transfers for settlement programs. Provinces outside of Quebec were restless about not receiving their share immigrants. According to Statistics Canada between 1996 and 2006 ninety-four percent of immigrants to Canada settled in Ontario, Quebec, British Columbia, and Alberta.³² Thus leaving provinces such as Saskatchewan left to share the remaining six percent with the other provinces. A movement was lead by Manitoba to get the federal government to also address the needs of provinces outside Quebec and Ontario. Out of these negotiations there were intergovernmental agreements created and the Provincial Nominee Program(PNP) concept was introduced.³³ The PNPs are essentially a tool to help provinces gain greater control over their immigration levels. Manitoba was the first province, outside of Quebec, to sign an agreement with the feds in the nineties. Saskatchewan followed in 1998, with most other provinces following soon after.

Through the PNPs immigrants are generally selected by the provinces to fill labour shortages and whether or not they will be well suited to integrate. Logistically, the provinces nominate immigrants but the federal government still retains responsibility over criminal, security, and medical checks. Some PNPs are known to offer faster processing of documents than the federal programs as well as eased application requirements.³⁴ The recent federal-provincial agreements largely served to cement the PNPs — in the case of Saskatchewan this is

³¹ Vineberg, 313-315.

³² Tom Carter, "An Evaluation of The Manitoba Provincial Nominee Program," *Canada Research Chair in Urban Change and Adaptation and Professor of Geography* (Manitoba Labour and Immigration Division, July 2009) 7.

³³ Robert Vineberg, "Overview of Federal-Provincial Relations in Immigration and Integration Presentation," *Forum of Federation and the Mowat Centre Conference: Immigrant Integration and Canadian Federalism Exploring the Issues* (January 28, 2011).

³⁴ Leo, 495.

also true. The Saskatchewan Immigrant Nominee Program (SINP) started as a pilot project in 1998 and became more formalized in 2001. After several years the international student category was introduced to the SINP, enabling the province to design their own policy approach to international students and immigration. Without these agreements the provinces could have never taken the steps to attract and retain students for their respective labour markets.

In summary, the two perspectives discussed in this chapter demonstrate a policy system with various actors that possess interrelated interests. For example, the political economy perspective places importance on the “divided sovereignty” that characterizes the Canadian policy making system, which produces federal- provincial agreements and differing immigration opportunities for international graduates across the provinces. Cairns is focused on the various actors and institutions within the federal system, which then allow for provinces to create direct paths within their immigrant nominee programs for international graduates. Ultimately, federal and provincial governments have been engaged in advancing their interests and negotiating the division of jurisdictional powers within most policy domains since Confederation - immigration is no exception to this. The result within the realm of immigration is a proliferation of provincial immigration policies and is best described in the words of Alan Cairns as “a continuing vitality and assertiveness of the Canadian provinces.”³⁵ Consequently, this rise of the provincial interest and involvement in the realm of immigration, as well as internal political and economic factors along with external political and economic factors, significantly shape timelines and nature of the contemporary immigration policies related to international students discussed in the following chapters.

1.6 Thesis Organization

In addition to this chapter that has introduced the thesis topic, outlined a theoretical framework for understanding the alignment of policy making within the context of Canadian federalism, provided some historical background to federal and provincial relations in the area of immigration, the thesis consists of three other chapters. Chapter two (International Student Policies in Comparative Context) explains the political and economic motivations that shaped international students policies, then it discusses the approaches of selected countries and provinces as well as the federal government. Chapter three (Saskatchewan’s Policy Evolution) examines the key political and economic factors that led to the development of Saskatchewan’s

³⁵ Smiley, 445.

policy, the key elements of the policy, the extent to which it is similar or different than the policies of other selected provinces, and its implications for students. Chapter 4 (Conclusion) provides an overview of the findings regarding the development and elements of the policy in Saskatchewan within Canada's federal system. However, it also provides a brief assessment of the value and merits of the policy for the province, the students and their countries. This assessment will include some observations regarding, the relationship of policies related to international students and issues regarding the educational and employment opportunities for Aboriginal students in Saskatchewan.

Chapter 2

International Student Policies in Comparative Context

In the pursuit of economic competitiveness many national and sub-national governments have identified the economic and social value of international students both while studying and post-graduation. The development of the information economy, in the late 1990's, impacted the interest for skilled labour and it became imperative for countries to attract qualified immigrants to sustain economic growth. At this same time many countries within the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) began to ease their immigration rules in order to increase the flows of skilled labour — international students became part of that targeted skilled group.³⁶ Simultaneous to the development of the information economy, the number of international students was increasing significantly at educational institutions within OECD countries. Between 1998 and 2002 the percentage of international students increased on average by 34.9% at institutions in OECD countries.³⁷ This chapter has two primary objectives; the first is to provide an overview of the motivations for the development of international student policies from the perspective of host countries. These motivations are very similar across jurisdictions therefore relevant to Saskatchewan's policy approaches. The second objective is to provide a brief summary of the form that these policies have taken in selected countries, and particularly within the context of the Canadian federal system. It also provides a brief timeline of the development of provincial policies to provide additional context to Saskatchewan's experience. More specifically, this chapter underscores the premise that Saskatchewan's international student policy did not develop in isolation. Toward that end, this chapter provides a brief overview of the factors that provided the impetus for and shaped the policies of Australia, United Kingdom, United States and Canada, as well as the basic elements of their respective policies. In explaining their policies, special attention is devoted to their efforts not only to attract international students to study in their respective countries, but also to remove road blocks that students face in becoming permanent residents after graduation. Lastly, this chapter discusses some of the non-governmental policies and programs that can affect international student experiences and decisions around employment and immigration.

³⁶ Karine Tremblay, "Academic Mobility and Immigration," *Journal of Studies in International Education* (Association for Studies in International Education) 9 (2005): 197.

³⁷ Tremblay, 197.

2.1 Impetus and Imperatives for Developing International Student Policies

The rationale for developing international student policies and engaging in recruitment efforts can be largely explained by the benefits that countries gain from hosting international students at their universities. Karine Tremblay sheds light on the benefits for host countries in a 2005 article titled *Academic Mobility and Immigration*.³⁸ The report discusses the benefits and disadvantages of student mobility for countries of origin and host countries. The economic benefits are arguably most significant for host countries. One of the economic benefits is the revenue raised from tuition being charged at cost for international students. The additional resources are beneficial for the sustainability and development of the educational institutions, their programs and their services.³⁹ In Canada the economic benefits of hosting international students has been examined systematically on several occasions. In a 1993 report titled *Economic Impact of International Students in Canada*, author Miala Diambomba explored whether the revenue into the Canadian economy exceeded the cost for support programs. Diambomba concluded that the economic benefit outweighed the costs of having students study in Canada, not to mention the additional non-economic benefits of having international students at Canadian institutions. She concluded, “the resources spent on these students should be considered as an investment with important and immediate long-term returns.”⁴⁰ The federal government, in a 2010 report titled *Economic Impact of International Education*, revisited the economic impact of international students studying in Canada. The report found that international students were a source of approximately 291 million dollars in revenue for the government of Canada.⁴¹ The report made an interesting observation regarding the relative importance of revenues in Canadian dollars generated from international students by noting that “the total amount that international students spend in Canada (6.5 billion) is greater than our export of coniferous lumber (5.1 billion) and even greater than our export of coal (6.07 billion) to all other countries.” The report added that international students provide economic benefits both in creating jobs and in increasing government revenue.⁴² The report also highlighted the need to

³⁸ Tremblay, 197.

³⁹ Tremblay, 221-222.

⁴⁰ Miala Diambomba, *Economic Impact of International Students in Canada*, (Canadian Bureau for International Education, 1993)21.

⁴¹ Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada, *Economic Impact of International Education In Canada*, February 2010, <http://www.international.gc.ca/education/impact/aspx> (accessed June 2010).

⁴² Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada, III.

attract talented international students for economic purposes that are less quantifiable such research and cultural diversification.⁴³

There are several non-economic or at least 'less economic' centered benefits for host countries. The first is the enhancement of educational experience for Canadian students because of the presence of international students. The Canadian students' exposure to an international environment at their educational institution affects their ability to adjust to other cultures. Therefore, it is hoped the students would be able to function at a higher level after graduating, thereby increasing productivity and future incomes.⁴⁴ A second benefit highlighted by Canadian Minister of State Peter Kent, in a 2010 speech, is that when international students leave Canada after studying they may become future leaders and bridge partnerships for Canada.⁴⁵ Lastly, while international students are studying, they often make important contributions to research and development work at educational and research institutions of their host countries.⁴⁶

The benefits for retention of students following their graduation is largely centered upon the relief of stress on skilled labour markets, and the fact that international students are more likely to succeed than other skilled foreigners.⁴⁷ The labour market in Canada has experienced changes in the last two decades. One of the major changes was the increase in the amount of jobs filled by university graduates. In 1999 1.9 million jobs were filled by university grads and by 2010 that number was 4.4 million.⁴⁸ According to the OECD, Canada is not the only country that has experienced labour market shifts. It is predicted that in light of the continuing growth of the knowledge-based economy highly skilled workers will continue to be needed.⁴⁹ Thus, international students have become part of the strategy for ensuring economic success for many countries.

The value of international students as immigrants has also been identified in a report published by the Saskatchewan Institute for Public Policy. The report described international students as "representing a group that has undeniable advantages over other immigrant

⁴³ Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada, 1.

⁴⁴ Tremblay, 222.

⁴⁵ Peter Kent, "Address by Minister of State Kent at Conference of the Americas on International Education," *Conference of the Americas on International Education* (Calgary: Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada, October 22, 2010).

⁴⁶ Tremblay, 197.

⁴⁷ Tremblay, 222.

⁴⁸ The Association of Universities and Colleges in Canada, "Trends in Higher Education Volume 1 Enrolment," Vol. 1 (Ottawa, Alberta: AUCC, 2011)32.

⁴⁹ AUCC, 36.

groups.”⁵⁰ Some of the advantages international students possess as immigrants include having used English during study period, and having established networks in the communities in which they studied. Also, the need for foreign credential recognition is largely eliminated because they are graduates of the Canadian post-secondary education system. This article not only identified the advantages that international students have but also signaled that Saskatchewan was becoming, like many other jurisdictions, increasingly involved in recruitment and retention efforts aimed at such students.

2.2 International Student Policies in Selected Countries: Comparative Overview

The immediate economic advantages and potential long term labour market assistance has resulted in countries such as Australia, United Kingdom, and Canada embarking upon more aggressive recruitment strategies. These recruitment strategies have resulted in increased student mobility across many jurisdictions. Many major host countries are actively trying to remain competitive in this area.⁵¹ Tremblay, who also explored the competitive recruitment environment globally, stated “a growing internationalization of education systems is currently taking place worldwide.”⁵² Tremblay is referencing various countries such as Australia and the United Kingdom who have embarked upon aggressive recruitment campaigns, marketing their countries as education destinations and in some cases also developing and implementing strategies, policies, programs and projects for retaining the students after they graduate.

2.2.1 Australia's Policy Approach

Australia is an example of a country engaged in concentrated efforts to recruit and retain international students. In an interview with a Canadian federal official, Australia's policy and program initiatives were mentioned as having a significant impact on Canada's approach to recruitment. As of 2007, education was the country's third largest export service because of the high enrollments of international students.⁵³ Australia's approach has been to set itself apart from countries like the United States and Great Britain by promoting its cheaper tuition costs, proximity to Asia, and warmer climate.⁵⁴ However, the Australian approach to post-graduation policy is an entirely separate process from its efforts to attract students and provide study visas.

⁵⁰ Pavel Peykov, *Immigrant Skilled Workers: Should Canada Attract More Foreign Students?* (Regina Saskatchewan Institute for Public Policy, 2004) 27.14

⁵¹ Tremblay, 221.

⁵² Tremblay, 197.

⁵³ Simon Marginson, "Global Position and Position Taking: The Case of Australia," *Journal of Studies in International Education* (Association of Studies in International Education) 11, no. 5 (2007): 5.

⁵⁴ Marginson, 25.

The government makes it clear that student visas are for educational purposes and that the students must apply through the General Skilled Migration (GSM) stream if they wish to stay post-graduation. The GSM is a point system and is largely based upon labour market needs and students are not exempt from meeting these requirements. Australia appears to be selective about which students it would like to immigrate and the selection is largely based on specific national and regional labour market needs.⁵⁵ Although Australia has spent significant efforts to attract students, it has not necessarily extended those efforts into increasing permanent residency opportunities for students across all disciplines.

2.2.2 United Kingdom's Policy Approach

The United Kingdom is also one of the top three receiving countries of international students in the world. A multi-stakeholder approach to recruitment was developed in 1999 through the Prime Minister's Initiative. The initiative was established to increase the flows of international students to the UK through building relationships with various countries and to promote the UK as a desirable place to attain education. In 2006 approximately £35 million was injected into the second phase of the initiative. These resources were in addition to the regular funding that is provided to international students through the British Council for its offices in 100 countries, which serve to promote the United Kingdom as an education destination.⁵⁶ In addition to promoting the UK internationally, the British Council partnered with UK universities engaged in significant research efforts to explore the future possibilities for student mobility.⁵⁷ On the British Council website, the importance of maintaining the UK's global position in international education was described as "helping us to build friendships with people from around the world, enabling us to understand more about each others' cultures and opening the doors to greater trade, investment and political influence."⁵⁸ In the area of post-graduation retention, the UK has also developed special training and employment programs to harness the international student talent in the sciences. In 2003 the UK launched the Science and Engineering Graduate Scheme (SEGS), in order to address the labour shortages in the science

⁵⁵ Department of Citizenship and Immigration, "Students and General Skilled Migration," www.immi.gov.au/students/students-gsm.htm (accessed July 2, 2010).

⁵⁶ AUCC, 29.

⁵⁷ Canadian Bureau for International Education, *The National Report on International Students in Canada* (Ottawa: CBIE, 2005) 8.

⁵⁸ The British Council, *Overview of PMI2 - The Prime Minister's Initiative for International Education-Education UK Marketing- British Council*, <http://www.britishcouncil.org/eumd-pmi2-overview.htm> (accessed Jan 2011).

and engineering fields.⁵⁹ Once in the SEGS, graduates are easily able to transition into the Highly Skilled Migrant Programme (HSMP), which is essentially a direct path to permanent residency. The key to the HSMP is that the graduates or other skilled migrants are exempt from the requirement to possess a job offer within the UK to apply. They are able to come to the UK and seek work for one year with a potential extension of up to three years.⁶⁰ However, the UK's program is selective in the disciplines that it chooses to target for post-graduate retention.

2.2.3 United States' Policy Approach

The United States (U.S.) is the third country that has attracted a significant share of international students to study in its educational institutions. For the purpose of attraction and recruitment the U.S. has set up advising and information offices in selected countries. The government has also created the Education USA website, where potential and existing students can learn all about studying in the U.S. as well as access information about scholarships.⁶¹ In the past the United States has easily attracted students to study however, two factors have threatened to unseat the U.S. as a top choice for international students. The first is that for a period following September 11, 2001 the international student flows were reduced, likely because of tighter security procedures from which students were not exempt. Secondly, there is emerging competition for international students from countries such as Japan, Malaysia, and Singapore. This competition has more potential long-term effects for the United States. For example, Japan has recently announced plans to double its number of foreign students and assist graduates in finding employment in Japan after graduation.⁶² The U.S. does offer significant post-graduation work opportunities, the U.S. offers the Optional Practical Training (OPT) program that allows graduates to work for twelve months after graduation. The Department of Homeland security has extended the work permit to twenty-nine months for graduates in the science, technology, engineering, or mathematics fields of study.⁶³ The U.S. like Australia is focused on accepting specific skilled immigrants and there are less student specific paths for immigration in the U.S. than other jurisdictions. However, there are opportunities for skilled people, including students,

⁵⁹ Tremblay, 215.

⁶⁰ Tremblay, 215.

⁶¹ Canadian Bureau for International Education, *The National Report on International Students in Canada* (Ottawa: CBIE, 2005)7.

⁶² Council on Foreign Relations, "U.S. Immigration Policy," *Independent Task Force Report NO.63*, Jeb Bush, Thomas III McLarty and Edward Alden (New York: Council of Foreign Relations, 2009)16.

⁶³ Council on Foreign Relations, 16.

to become temporary residents in order to join the labour market.⁶⁴ The H-1B is an example of a work visa that allows skilled foreign workers and international student graduates to work for a specified amount of time. Although the visa does have a strict cap of approximately 65,000 per year, there is an additional 20,000 spots reserved for international students. The H-1B also allows its visa holders to have dual-intent, it is one of the only visas which allows applicants to be applying for a work permit and express intent for permanent residency.⁶⁵ Like Australia the opportunities to immigrate are limited, thus obtaining a study visa does not provide significant advantage to obtaining permanent residency.

2.3 Evolution of Canadian Federal Policies

Canada, eager to solidify its economic position globally, has also adopted policies to attract and retain international students in the last two decades. At the federal level the responsibilities for international student policies are largely shared between the departments of Citizenship and Immigration (CIC) and Foreign Affairs and International Trade (DFAIT). CIC has responsibility for the employment and immigration policies and DFAIT is responsible for marketing Canada as an educational destination to potential students globally. Governmental agencies such as Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) also play a role in providing scholarships and avenues for internationalization at Canada's educational institutions.⁶⁶

Statistics Canada first began gathering information on international students in 1920. At that time there were approximately 1,300 full time international students at Canadian universities.⁶⁷ A non-governmental organization, Friendly Relations with Overseas Students was formed in 1950 at the University of Toronto to help international students but also to bring together foreign students and Canadian students for mutual benefit.⁶⁸ However, Canadian policies specifically targeting international students and any substantive amount of research did not emerge until the 1980's. The major policies have materialized in the last decade or so with the provincial nominee and federal employment programs. During the 1980's there were some scholarship programs and policy initiatives in the area of work permits that emerged to target

⁶⁴ Tremblay, 207

⁶⁵ Council on Foreign Relations. 17.

⁶⁶ George Tillman Consulting, *Canadian Programs and Policies Affecting International Students*, Background Report (Ottawa: Department of the Secretary of State of Canada, 1990)4.

⁶⁷ Tina Chui, "International Students In Canada," *Education Quarterly Review* (Statistics Canada) 3, no. 3 (1996)42.

⁶⁸ Christopher G Cunningham, *The Integration of International Students on Canadian Post-Secondary Campuses*, (Canadian Bureau for International Education, 1991)1.

international students wishing to study in Canada. In 1988 CIDA contributed over two million dollars to a South Africa Education Trust Fund. This contribution was a part of a series of programs, in the context of an aid development strategy. CIDA had stated its intention to double the number of international students it supported to come to Canada.⁶⁹ In the late eighties it was common for educational institutions to express the sentiment that it was a “moral obligation” to help struggling nations by educating their students, in addition to promoting international understanding. Provinces held a similar position to the post-secondary institutions but also needed to balance the international student enrollment numbers with maintaining access for Canadian students.⁷⁰ A 1987 national conference that brought together stakeholders from post-secondary institutions, provincial, and federal governments adopted a statement describing the Canadian attitude towards international students. The statement was, “Foreign students are now seen as a necessary component of post-secondary educationThere is a consensus that an open door policy and support policy for these students should be developed.”⁷¹

In the nineties CIDA contributed approximately \$ 2.1 million to a trust fund to provide opportunities to young South African students to study in Canada and aimed to double the number of students it supported to come to Canada. CIDA’s efforts were part of a larger new aid development strategy.⁷² Also, in 1988, the federal government began to allow international students to be employed on campus while studying, those students who wished to work had to apply for authorization and pay a fifty-dollar fee to the Canada Employment and Immigration Commission. The policy change also allowed the spouses of international students to access the labour market.⁷³ The importance of the ability to work as an international student was demonstrated in student responses from *The 1998 Survey of International Students in Canadian Universities*. When asked about their perspectives on government policy, over half of the students mentioned the issue of easing work restrictions as being of high importance to them. Some of the students needed employment income to finance their education and others mentioned the necessity to gain Canadian career experience prior to graduation. Other challenges mentioned were expensive tuition fees and integration into their university

⁶⁹Tillman, 4.

⁷⁰ Tillman, 7.

⁷¹ Tillman, 6.

⁷² Tillman, 4.

⁷³ Tillman, 5.

community.⁷⁴ Therefore, efforts to ease employment restrictions would likely assist in recruitment.

By the 1990's the federal government also recognized the efforts and activities of other countries and began to take steps to make Canada more competitive at attracting international students. In the late nineties CIC created the Advisory Committee on International Students and Immigration (ACISI), to provide a venue for key stakeholders to consult on potential or existing policy. The key stakeholders include educational associations representing secondary and post-secondary institutions, student lobby organizations, and representatives from federal/territorial governments. The ACISI meets approximately one to two times a year to discuss the new policy initiatives of the government.⁷⁵

In the area of marketing and recruitment there was no consistent marketing plan articulated by the federal government until 2008. In addition the other stakeholders such as the provinces and educational institutions were operating without a consistent vision for student recruitment. In 2008, DFAIT launched the *Imagine* campaign. *Imagine* was designed as a marketing plan to promote Canada as an education destination to compete with rival countries such as Australia and U.K. The marketing plan was also intended to provide educational institutions, governments, and various other stakeholders with consistent messaging to engage potential students. Provincial governments are also permitted to utilize the brand's promotional material through co-branding. The provinces are able to use logos or customize brand products to suit their needs with some limitations such as font and avoiding comparisons with other provinces.⁷⁶ The website describing the implementation of *Imagine*, stated that the branding was needed in order to compete with other countries and to promote Canada as an appealing education destination.⁷⁷ However, in the lead up to *Imagine* campaign the number of international student entries into Canada at the university level was on the rise. In 2003 there were 28,165 entries and by 2008 this had increased to 31,368.⁷⁸

⁷⁴ John de Vries and Stephen Richer, *The 1988 Survey of International Students in Canadian Universities*, (Ottawa: Department of the Secretary of State of Canada, 1988) 25.

⁷⁵ Panel of CIC Officials, Personal Interview. 13, July 2011.

⁷⁶ Council of Ministers of Education Canada, "Imagine Education au/In Canada," *Guidelines and Templates for Provincial and Territorial Governments and the CMEC*, 2009. <http://imagine.cmec.ca/en/guidelines/governments/>

⁷⁷ Council of Ministers of Education Canada, *Imagine Education au/in Canada - Brand Use Guidelines: Home*, June 2010, www.imagine.cmec.ca/en/ (accessed June 2011).

⁷⁸ Citizenship and Immigration Canada-Research and Evaluation Branch, "Evaluation of the International Student Program" (Ottawa: Government of Canada, July 2010)iii.

In 2002 CIC became more active in the pursuit of international students as immigrants in the lead up to the enactment of the Immigration and Refugee Protection Act (IRPA). One of the purposes of the IRPA was to help with the area of temporary residents, which is a category that international students belonged to. The IRPA regulates who can study in Canada and the ability to work while studying.⁷⁹ After 2002 CIC began easing the restrictions on employment by allowing students to work off-campus and eventually developing the Canadian Experience Class as a direct path for students to immigrate after graduation. According to a former CIC official, the shift that occurred during the 2000s was characterized by a human capital approach that was influenced by the concern from industry groups about the availability of skilled workers.⁸⁰ The official also highlighted that the healthy economic situation of the country particularly in the west inspired the government to take action regarding international students.

In the 2005 Annual Report to Parliament on immigration the section addressing foreign students stated that CIC needed to expedite application processes for students in order to improve competitiveness.⁸¹ The former CIC official highlighted this need for action when he stated “the motivation was there to create a quicker avenue for students so they didn’t go elsewhere.”⁸² The concern was that the longer wait times were impacting student’s decisions on whether to stay in Canada after graduation. The number of post-graduation work permits also started to increase around 2005.⁸³ Many of the federal initiatives were developed in conjunction with provinces. However, despite the provincial involvement with international students, the federal government still administered the post-graduate work program. Students within all provinces, including Quebec, must apply for the post-graduation work permit if they wish to stay after graduation. Students can apply for the post-graduate work permit for the length of time of their study if under four years, but not exceeding three years.⁸⁴

The Canadian Experience Class (CEC), launched in 2008, was designed to be a direct path for international student graduates to permanent residency. One year of work experience in their field is the main requirement for students wanting to apply for the CEC. In the CIC

⁷⁹ Citizenship and Immigration Canada-Research and Evaluation Branch, iii.

⁸⁰ Former CIC Official, Personal Interview, 14, March 2011.

⁸¹ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "Annual Report to Parliament on Immigration" (Ottawa: Minister of Public Works and Government Services Canada, 2005)9.

⁸² Former CIC Official, Personal Interview, 14, March 2011.

⁸³ Citizenship and Immigration Canada-Research and Evaluation Branch, 7.

⁸⁴ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, *Studying in Canada: Work Permit for students-Working after graduation*, December 15, 2009, <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/study/work-postgrad.asp> (accessed May 4, 2010).

immigration levels plan for 2010 it was estimated that the CEC program would take up three percent of the economic class immigrants with the federal skilled workers taking up 75%.⁸⁵ The federal government had identified international student graduates as an ideal immigrant prior to the program's development as it was being considered for several years before its actual implementation.⁸⁶ The implementation of CEC was also a demonstration that CIC was open to students expressing dual-intent when applying for study permits, which was not always clear in the past. On the CIC website it emphasizes that "having both intents —one for temporary residence through study permit, and one for permanent residency — is legitimate."⁸⁷ Attracting international students is a stated priority of the federal government and CIC is aware of the importance in clarifying their acceptance of dual-intent so students were assured their study permits would not be rejected if they expressed dual-intent.

In June 2010, the federal government removed exemptions for international students to apply for the federal skilled worker program (FSWP). This change came about soon after the implementation of CEC - prior to the spring of 2010, students were able to apply under the FSWP and were exempt from needing to belong to one of the "29 in demand occupations." The rationale for this change cited by the CIC department was that they were eliminating the overlap in student categories within the CEC and provincial programs.⁸⁸ However, this change does reduce the options that students have to apply for permanent residency, particularly those who wish to apply prior to graduation. Some students have work experience from their home countries and may be more suited to apply for the FSWP but because of these changes it makes it more difficult. According to CIC officials, the exemption that existed prior to 2010 was only in place because the CEC program had not yet been introduced.⁸⁹ This is the only federal policy change that reduces avenues for international students to become permanent residents. Apart from this policy the federal government, like the government of Saskatchewan and most other provinces, has produced a succession of recruitment, employment, and immigration policies to make Canada more attractive to international students.

⁸⁵ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, *Annual Report to Parliament on Immigration*, (Ottawa: Minister of Public Works and Government Services Canada, 2009)10.

⁸⁶ Panel of CIC Officials, Personal Interview. 13, July 2011.

⁸⁷ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "Dual Intent," *Studying in Canada: Study Permits*, 2008, www.cic.gc.ca/english/study/institutions/intent.asp (accessed January 13, 2012).

⁸⁸ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "Backgrounders-Changes to Federal Skilled worker and Investor Immigration Programs," June 26, 2010, www.cic.gc.ca/english/department/media/backgrounders/2010-06-26c.asp#tphp%20idtp (accessed July 3, 2010).

⁸⁹ Panel of CIC Officials, Personal Interview. 13, July 2011.

2.4 Provincial Policy Development Timelines

Prior to the creation of student categories within provincial nominee programs there was very little in the way of provincial policies specifically for international students and immigration. To reiterate, the various federal-provincial agreements on immigration were negotiated on different timelines and so too were the provincial nominee programs and the international student policies. The policy timelines of other provinces undoubtedly affected Saskatchewan's approach. Firstly, it is significant to note that Saskatchewan was not the first province to develop student policies, which means that Saskatchewan was not a leader in this area. Despite a few differences, Saskatchewan's policies are not very different from other provinces. The similarities and differences between provincial international student policies are covered in more detail in Chapter three. Manitoba was the first province to initiate special eligibility for international students in their provincial nominee program in 2001.⁹⁰ British Columbia was a close second in 2002.⁹¹ However, Alberta did not develop a stream or category dedicated to international students until 2007, so although Saskatchewan was not ahead of all western provinces it was also not the last province to develop these policies.⁹² Saskatchewan was in the middle of the western provinces when it launched the international student category in the Saskatchewan Immigrant Nominee Program in 2004. In an interview with a provincial government official it was highlighted that the activities of other provinces in the area of international students, "gave us the impetus to look at this more closely."⁹³ By 2005, with other provinces leading the way in identifying international students as prime candidates for immigrants and to attract students to study in their provinces, Saskatchewan began taking steps to ease the restrictions on recent international student graduates to apply for the SINP and negotiate with the federal government to allow students to work off-campus while studying.

2.5 Secondary Policies Affecting International Students

There are several secondary policies to those related to employment and immigration, which still reflect government and educational institutions commitment to attracting international students. These various policies and programs were highlighted in the 1998 report entitled A

⁹⁰ Gov of Manitoba news release Government of Manitoba, "Canada and Manitoba Expand Immigration Agreement," *Manitoba Government*, November 27, 2001, www.gov.mb.ca/chc/press/top/2001/11/2001-11-27-05.html (accessed Jan 12, 2011).

⁹¹ Ministry of Community, Aboriginal and Women's Services, "Immigration Program Reduces Critical Skills Shortage," *News Release* (Government of British Columbia, December 2002, 2002).

⁹² Government of Alberta, "Expanded Program Will Help Increase Immigration Flow," *News Release* (Edmonton, May 22, 2007).

⁹³ AAEI Official. Personal Interview. 17 February 2011.

Warm Welcome? As the title suggests the publisher of the report, the Association of Universities and Colleges in Canada, questioned whether or not Canada is welcoming to international students. The report looked at both government and educational institutions policy. It began by focusing on tuition fees, because education is in provincial jurisdiction, each province and its institutions have slightly different approaches to assigning tuition rates.⁹⁴ In all provinces international students pay a differential tuition fee in comparison to their Canadian counterparts. Most provinces, including Saskatchewan, have no formal policy regarding tuition for international students. However, in the past some provinces have helped to guide tuition rates by setting minimum or maximum amounts for international students.⁹⁵ For example, the Government of Manitoba still retains control over whether tuition fees can be raised. This was demonstrated when the Department of Advanced Education and Literacy rejected ten out of twelve tuition fee requests from institutions.⁹⁶ In addition, the government uses their tuition rates as an attraction method. Their website boasts that they offer the lowest tuition for international students offering a comparison with other tuition rates across Canada.⁹⁷ Saskatchewan's two main universities both charge a differential fee for international students both at graduate and undergraduate level. At the University of Saskatchewan international undergraduate students are assessed at 2.6 times the rate of Canadian students.⁹⁸

Another secondary policy area that impacts international students and their families is health insurance. Health is in the jurisdiction of provincial governments so the coverage varies by province. In Saskatchewan, Alberta, and British Columbia the provincial public health insurance benefits are extended to international students.⁹⁹ Ontario does not extend its basic public health insurance to international students and their dependents, but the universities in Ontario have united to provide the University Health Insurance Plan (UHIP) that is mandatory for international students. For 2010-2011 the health insurance premiums for single students is

⁹⁴ Karen McBride, *A Warm Welcome? Recruitment and Admission of International Students to Canadian Universities: Policies, Procedures and Capacity*, Case Studies (Ottawa: Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada, 1998)3.

⁹⁵ McBride, 53.

⁹⁶ Government of Manitoba, "News Releases," *Province of Manitoba*, June 25, 2010, <http://www.gov.mb.ca/chc/press/top/2010/06/2010-06-25-08700-9029.html> (accessed November 11, 2010).

⁹⁷ Department of Advanced Education and Literacy, *Tuition and Fees*, <http://www.gov.mb.ca/ie/study/tuition.html> (accessed November 11, 2010).

⁹⁸ University of Saskatchewan, *Tuition - University of Saskatchewan*, 1 2010, November, <http://students.usask.ca/current/paying/tuition.php> (accessed November 11, 2010).

⁹⁹ McBride, 55.

approximately \$720 a year and for those with dependents it can range from \$1,296 to \$3,312.¹⁰⁰ Therefore, if an Ontario international student had a family this would be a significant added cost to their tuition and other living expenses. Health care and tuition policies are examples of how the division of powers in specific policy areas can create varied policy outcomes across the provinces; which ultimately impact on the experience and choices of international students while in Canada.

2.6 Role of Educational Institutions

This thesis is largely focused on government policies such as recruitment, employment, and immigration of international students. However, the evolution of policy and programs has not just taken place in the realm of government. The educational institutions have also been a part of the shift to both attract and support the experience of international students. The main involvement of educational institutions is twofold, firstly institutions have developed services targeted specifically to international students and secondly institutions have engaged in partnerships with governments and other institutions to encourage recruitment. By 1987 most of Canada's public universities had a form of an international student office to provide information tailored to international students and counseling services. The student offices have student advisors that help students with housing, health care, immigration, and counseling on academic matters.¹⁰¹ These student support services are a vital part of the student experience in Canada and can assist in attracting students. As competition among countries for international students has increased, the role of universities as support service providers has increased in importance.¹⁰²

The second activity of educational institutions has been in the area of recruitment. In the past Canada's universities have not been as aggressive in terms of recruitment, in contrast to comparable institutions in other countries. However, in recent years many universities have increased their involvement in recruitment activities. A 2006 internationalization survey, conducted by AUCC, found that the majority of universities in Canada have recognized the benefits of increasing international student flows.¹⁰³ This effort has been evidenced by an increase in student enrollments, which many Canadian universities attribute to targeted

¹⁰⁰ University Health Insurance Plan, *UHIP - Premium Table*, http://www.uhip.ca/_uploads/en_PremiumTable.htm (accessed November 12, 2010).

¹⁰¹ Tillman, 1.

¹⁰² The Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada, "Internationalizing Canadian Campuses," *AUCC 2006 Internationalization Survey Update* (Ottawa: AUCC, 2007)6.

¹⁰³ AUCC, *Internationalization Survey Update*, 5.

recruitment strategies and relationship building internationally.¹⁰⁴ In November 2010 presidents of fifteen of Canadian Universities went to India to establish partnerships with other universities and promote Canada as an education destination. This was the first time a group of representatives this size came together in a joint effort to promote Canada as an education destination. A Globe and Mail story covering this trip featured a young business student from India who chose the University of British Columbia over the famed London School of Economics.¹⁰⁵ The business student stated that the fact that Canadian universities had visited her high school was part of her decision to come to Canada. The article also highlighted the fact that although Canada is still attracting less international students than other countries such as Britain and Australia but is working to change that. This coming together of university leaders is another example of an effort on the part of educational institutions as stakeholders to increase the number of students who choose Canada.

Conclusion

“International students are attractive to Canada. They bring economic, social and cultural benefits to the institutions at which they study, to the organizations in which they work and to the communities in which they live.”¹⁰⁶ This quote from a 2011 CIC report summarizes well the recent approach of Canada’s federal and most provincial governments. In the last two decades the federal government has made special efforts to attract and ease employment restrictions for international students - the changes to the FSWP were a small exception to these efforts. Canada has not been alone in these efforts, particularly in the area of attraction of international students: countries such as United Kingdom, Australia, and the United States have all been quite successful in attracting their share of international students. In addition, most provincial governments have undertaken their own policies and programs to attract and retain international students. It has become widely accepted internationally that a well-educated workforce is needed to stimulate and sustain economic growth. This need to maintain well-educated workforces has necessitated national and sub-national governments to look outside their own borders to meet this demand and ultimately their economic goals.¹⁰⁷ The next chapter devotes special attention to

¹⁰⁴ Karen Birchard, "Canadian Universities See Big Jump in Foreign Student Enrollments," *Chronicle of Higher Education* 56, no. 8 (2009): 36.

¹⁰⁵ James Bradshaw, "University leaders woo students in India," *The Globe and Mail* (November 6, 2010).

¹⁰⁶ Citizenship and Immigration Canada-Research and Evaluation Branch, 1.

¹⁰⁷ Douglas Watt, Tim Krywulak and Kurtis Kitagawa, *Renewing Immigration: Towards a Convergence and Consolidation of Canada's Immigration Policies and Systems*, (Conference Board of Canada, 2008)Executive Summary.

the development of Saskatchewan's policies to attract and retain international students as well as a brief comparison of policy attributes with other provinces.

Chapter 3

Saskatchewan's Policy Evolution

In 2001 the number of international students studying in Saskatchewan, at the post-secondary level was 2,134, and in 2010 that number increased by 1,388.¹⁰⁸ The rise of the population of international students in Saskatchewan during the last decade has not been an undirected trend. The increase can in part be explained by Saskatchewan's policy initiatives to ease employment restrictions and increase immigration opportunities for students. This has largely taken place through the bilateral federal-provincial agreements and memorandums of understanding that have been signed during the past decade. A realization and shift has occurred in the last two decades to recognize the economic and social value of international students both prior to and after graduation. This realization has occurred at the provincial and federal levels, as well as at the institutional level with universities gaining interest in internationalization.

This chapter chronicles the evolution of Saskatchewan's policy towards international students - while illustrating the division of powers and the various political and economic factors involved in the creation of policies. The focus is primarily on the policies and programs for the attraction of international students, facilitating their ability to work while studying, and staying after graduation to work in Saskatchewan. It also provides a limited comparative perspective that will highlight some of the main similarities and differences between the programs at the provincial level.

3.1 Saskatchewan's Political and Economic Environment

There were several political and economic factors that impacted Saskatchewan's decision to target international students through immigration policies and the easing of employment restrictions. The first factor was the population and immigration fluctuation levels in the province. Both the decrease in population in the 1990s and the growth of the economy more recently has impacted the government's approach to immigration policy. There was also a concern about demographics because the population of Saskatchewan was also aging with the baby-boomers retiring over the next few decades, leaving a big gap in the workforce. In the lead up to the inception of the Saskatchewan Immigrant Nominee Program(SINP), Saskatchewan was

¹⁰⁸ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, *CIC Digital Library 2010*, (Ottawa: Government of Canada, 2010).

trailing behind other provinces in attracting their share of immigrants, thus the province began to evaluate its immigration policy options. According to Statistics Canada throughout the 1990's Ontario, British Columbia, and Quebec attracted almost ninety percent of new immigrants.¹⁰⁹ Thus, other provinces were reaping economic benefits from increasing immigration. Saskatchewan was not always struggling for its share of immigrants; in the early days of Confederation the province was an attractive destination for immigrants searching for a place to settle because of its abundant affordable farmland. In 1935 the population exceeded 900,000. However, by the 1990s immigration had slowed down significantly and Saskatchewan began to lose people to other provinces.¹¹⁰ The decreasing population of the province gave the government motivation to explore policy options in immigration to ensure the economic sustainability of the province.

A second factor to Saskatchewan's interest in immigration policy and specifically international students was the activities of other jurisdictions. Saskatchewan had the inspiration to create programs to make the province more appealing to potential students from the example set by other jurisdictions both domestically and internationally. A government official present when the student category was established, stated that the activities of other jurisdictions gave the "impetus to Saskatchewan to consider the policy options more closely."¹¹¹ As discussed in previous chapter, Saskatchewan was not the first province to develop an immigration nominee program or an international student category, so it was able to use the examples of other provinces to develop its own.

A third factor is the economic boom that started in 2008, which has influenced the government's more recent policies such as the expansion of graduate retention incentives. A 2009 Globe and Mail headline celebrating that Saskatchewan had become a "Have Province at Last" had a quote from a farmer stating, "It's a nice place to be right now, Saskatchewan. Everybody is pretty optimistic."¹¹² This optimism is reflected in the government's decision making because the government is planning for sustainable continued economic and population

¹⁰⁹ Statistics Canada. Proportion of Foreign Born, Canada, provinces and territories, (Ottawa: Government of Canada, 1991, 1996, 2001).

¹¹⁰ Pavel Peykov, "Final Destination or a Stopover: Attracting Immigrants to Saskatchewan," *SIPP Briefing Note* (Saskatchewan Institute for Public Policy), no. 7 (May 2004)1.

¹¹¹ AAEI Official, Personal Interview. 17 February 2011.

¹¹² John Gray, "Saskatchewan a "Have" Province at Last- Globe and Mail," *The Globe and Mail*, December 29, 2009, www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/rob-magazine/saskatchewan-a-have-province-at-last/article14043751/ (accessed January 15, 2012).

growth. The provinces news releases and media boast about the growing industries such as mining and oil. The government is forecasting that it will experience continued economic growth and therefore need significant skilled labour to meet the needs of a growing economy.¹¹³ The province also recently celebrated a growing population. In the first quarter of 2010 the province's population increased by 3,711 people. This increase is the largest first quarter population growth since 1972, thus it was hailed by the government as a signal of real growth and opportunity for the province. Minister Norris stated in the press release that Saskatchewan had one of the lowest unemployment rates in the country and that there were more than 5, 700 jobs posted on the government jobs website.¹¹⁴ With a growing economy and future labour shortage prospects the government is motivated to ensure its immigration policy reflects the skilled labour needs for its future. The government became interested in immigration policy when it was experiencing declines in population but has recommitted and recognized the value of making immigration a priority for the province in a period of economic and population growth as well.

Lastly, in the period leading up to Saskatchewan developing international student policies, federal-provincial relations in immigration improved and collaboration between the federal and provincial government became more common. The result was that several provinces were beginning to take greater control over their immigration programs, Saskatchewan followed their lead.¹¹⁵ The federal government was embarking on negotiating bilateral inter-governmental agreements on immigration in order to allow for provinces to take a more formalized role in immigration through the PNPs. The first Canada-Saskatchewan Immigration Agreement in 1998 set the stage for Saskatchewan to take action in the arena of immigrant selection. The 1998 agreement dealt with multiple topics including immigration planning, settlement, and most significantly the establishment of the Provincial Nominee Pilot Program. At the time of signing, the provincial minister described the nominee program as allowing Saskatchewan to recruit immigrants that could make a significant contribution to the provincial economy. With new selection powers Saskatchewan could exert greater influence over the immigrant flows to the

¹¹³ Derek Abma, "Saskatchewan, Alberta to lead economic growth in 2012," *Nationa Post- Financial Post*, December 7, 2011, http://business.financialpost.com/2011/12/07/saskatchewan-alberta-toleader-economic-growth-in-2012/?_lsa=3234b7ce (accessed January 12, 2012).

¹¹⁴ Advanced Education, Employment and Labour, "Saskatchewan's Population Surpasses 1, 040, 000 For The First Time Ever," *Government of Saskatchewan - News Releases*, June 28, 2010, www.gov.sk.ca/news?newsId=ca0190b8-8cd0-41f5-9e50-329d889aa57a (accessed Feb 6, 2011).

¹¹⁵ Peykov, 4.

province.¹¹⁶ This first agreement provided the basis and framework for Saskatchewan to negotiate future agreements such as off-campus work permits with the federal government.

3.2 International Student Policy Evolution

With both international and domestic jurisdictions as guides, the political and economic environment in Saskatchewan was ripe to develop its own international student policies. Policy options for targeting international students as well as immigration more generally were explored in two key reports released prior to the 2005 Canada-Saskatchewan agreement. These reports were a signal of a growing interest in immigration policy as an ingredient to economic prosperity for the province. Pat Lorje's report *Open up Saskatchewan* was front and center in the discussion surrounding immigration within the province in the early 2000's. The report was more generally focused on increasing the population in Saskatchewan, and one of the strategies was the immigration of skilled workers. In the report Lorje recommended that the SINP program be expanded to include the student category. The report stated "Creating a student category under the SINP would allow foreign born graduates to enjoy a more seamless transition to permanent residency and provide the province with an expanded pool of highly skilled individuals."¹¹⁷ The report was requested by Premier Lorne Calvert and contained several recommendations for government policy action. Ultimately, by the government's response in strengthening the SINP, it was an indication that the government was moving towards increasing immigration to the province and that students would be a key ingredient to making that happen. A second key report, that followed Lorje's, was the "Immigrant Skilled Workers: Should Canada Attract More Foreign Students?" by Pavel Peykov. The Saskatchewan Institute for Public Policy published Peykov's article in the same year as the creation of the student category. Peykov made a case that immigration was positive for economic growth but that policy approaches must also consider which types of immigrants are best suited for Canada. He stated "The focus is on one group of people who can contribute to this country's development- foreign students."¹¹⁸ A government official who was present at the time of the Lorje report also underscored that the Saskatchewan government's decision to focus on international students was based upon the reasoning that

¹¹⁶Intergovernmental and Aboriginal Affairs, "Canada and Saskatchewan Sign Immigration Agreement," *Government of Saskatchewan - News Releases*, March 16, 1998, www.gov.sk.ca/new?newsId=38061a88-4c76-45f6-9e (accessed January 24, 2010).

¹¹⁷ Pat Lorje, *Open up Saskatchewan*, (Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2003)15.

¹¹⁸ Pavel Peykov, *Immigrant Skilled Workers: Should Canada Attract More Foreign Students?*, Public Policy Paper, University of Regina (The Saskatchewan Institute of Public Policy, 2004)3.

international students would be ideal immigrants, because they are already acclimated to the province.¹¹⁹

The policies in Saskatchewan took shape largely through the Department of Advanced Education Employment and Labour, which changed in 2010 to the Department of Advanced Education, Employment and Immigration. Each year since the creation of the student category the government has taken policy steps relating to international student recruitment efforts, easing employment restrictions, and immigration opportunities. By taking all of these policy steps, discussed below, the Saskatchewan government was hoping to create an attractive package of studying, working, and immigrating opportunities that would attract international students to make Saskatchewan their home.

The most significant policy step taken by the Saskatchewan government in relation to international students was the 2004 creation of the student category within the SINP. Prior to this category being created there was no direct avenue for international students to apply for permanent residency through the SINP. Under this category, students who graduated from a Saskatchewan post-secondary institution and secured work in their field were eligible to apply. Applicants were also required to complete at least six months of paid employment within the province and their field of study, as well as possess a post-graduate work permit from CIC.¹²⁰ In the press release announcing the creation of the student category, the government estimated that there was a skills shortage for approximately 10,000 jobs in Saskatchewan, many of which required post-secondary education.¹²¹ This number was included to provide an explanation for the government's plan to actively pursue international students as potential skilled labour for the province.

In 2004, the same year as the creation of student category, the Canada and Saskatchewan governments extended the post-graduate work permit by one year. This allowed students up to three years after graduation to gain work experience in Saskatchewan. Judy Sgro, federal immigration minister, described this new policy as win-win for both students and the province when she said: "Not only does it provide opportunities for graduates in the province to gain

¹¹⁹ AAEI Official, Personal Interview. February 17, 2011.

¹²⁰ Government of Saskatchewan, "Official Website of Saskatchewan Immigration," *Immigrating*, 2011, <http://www.saskimmigrationcanada.ca/student>.

¹²¹ Advanced Education Employment and Labour, "Saskatchewan Expanding Immigration Program," *Government of Saskatchewan News Releases*, May 6, 2004, www.gov.sk.ca/news?newsId=870fb75-13f1-4bfa-9049-d9bd5c9a8c16 (accessed January 12, 2011).

valuable work experience, but also provides an additional incentive for international students considering Saskatchewan to complete their studies.”¹²² The federal government had similar bilateral agreements or memorandums of understanding with other provinces.¹²³

Just one year after the creation of the student category, a new Canada-Saskatchewan Immigration Agreement was signed, and cemented the SINP more formally. The agreement also removed the cap on nominations for the SINP, allowing the province greater control over its immigration program.¹²⁴ This contributed to further entrenching of the student category into Saskatchewan’s immigration program. From a broader perspective the agreement also solidified Saskatchewan’s role in immigrant selection. With the new agreement in place the Saskatchewan government proceeded to negotiate employment measures with the federal government for international students. Those negotiations led to policy changes that were negotiated through bilateral MOUs signed by the Saskatchewan and federal governments as they did before the 2005 agreement. In 2006 a MOU regarding working off-campus was signed, the students had to complete six months of study at a Saskatchewan post-secondary institution before they could apply for the off-campus work permit. In addition, the students could work a maximum of twenty hours a week and full time during holidays and summer break.¹²⁵ This new employment policy was presented as another avenue by government to make Saskatchewan more attractive to international students. Providing opportunities for off-campus employment opened up the opportunities in Saskatchewan for those students who needed to work to support themselves. The AEEL minister Pat Atkinson articulated that it was “hoped that many of them will have the opportunity to stay in the province to continue their careers and raise their families here.”¹²⁶ Saskatchewan was demonstrating its intention to continue actively encouraging international students to stay after graduation and providing the policies to make that happen.

¹²² Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "Canada and Saskatchewan Announce a Pilot Project for Foreign Students," *News Releases 2004-09*, May 6, 2004, www.cic.gc.ca/english/departement/media/releases/2004/0409-pre.asp (accessed 15 January 2011).

¹²³ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "Federal-Provincial/Territorial Agreements," *Welcome to Citizenship and Immigration Canada*, December 20, 2010, www.cic.gc.ca/english/departement/laws-policy/agreements.index.asp (accessed January 15, 2011).

¹²⁴ Advanced Education Employment and Labour, "Canada-Saskatchewan Sign New Immigration Agreement," *Government of Saskatchewan News Releases*, June 1, 2005, www.gov.sk.ca/news?newsId=33f06277-a8c1-491e-94a3-90d9177c769c (accessed January 13, 2011).

¹²⁵ Advanced Education Employment and Labour, "International Students Can Now Work Off-Campus," *Government of Saskatchewan News Releases*, April 27, 2006, www.gov.sk.ca/news?newsId=3f72f508-d88e-47df-a5e3-0550ff8c0c57 (accessed January 12, 2011).

¹²⁶ Advanced Education Employment and Labour, "Work Off-Campus."

The next significant policy changes were the easing of employment requirements for the student category in 2008. Prior to this change students had to work in their area of study for six months and have a permanent full time job offer to apply for permanent residency through the SINP. The 2008 changes allowed students to utilize work experience and a job offer not within their area of study to meet the requirements to apply for the SINP.¹²⁷ In addition to easing work experience requirements the government opened up one of their graduate retention programs, initially reserved for Saskatchewan students, to international students. The retention program provides tuition rebates to students who chose to stay and work in Saskatchewan after graduation.

International student policy was not a stand-alone approach to immigration for the province. There was a movement from within government to make immigration policy a priority. In 2009, Saskatchewan released a new immigration strategy that outlined the expansion and creation of several immigration programs. The strategy placed emphasis on immigration policy playing an integral role in Saskatchewan's future. One of the goals of the strategy was to increase the number of nominations under the SINP. The SINP program started with less than 500 but that number has since significantly increased. In 2009-2010 it was projected that 3,400 nominations would be granted. When family members were included, this number translated into approximately 10,000 new residents for Saskatchewan.¹²⁸ This population growth was presented by the government as an opportunity to increase the diversity of the population, as well as the economy. The brochure produced to accompany the launch of the strategy included a section for international education, which stated Saskatchewan's intention to continue attracting bright students to study in the province. Within its general approach to providing opportunities to international students there was mention of a provincial council to provide joint marketing opportunities and easing requirements for SINP applications. The future action outlined was to increase the immigration levels of international students through the SINP.¹²⁹

The strategy emerged out of consultations with stakeholders within industry, community based organizations, professional associations, and educational institutions. Attracting

¹²⁷ Advanced Education Employment and Labour, "Changes to Immigration for International Students," *Government of Saskatchewan News Releases*, November 18, 2008, www.gov.sk.ca/news?newsId=aec7fb0c-e337-4b03-9926-4facd313722 (accessed February 11, 2011).

¹²⁸ Advanced Education Employment and Labour, "Saskatchewan's Immigration Strategy: Strengthening our Communities and Economies," *Saskatchewan Immigration Brochure*. (Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2009)8.

¹²⁹ Advanced Education, Employment and Labour, *Immigration Brochure* 4.

management talent, and enhanced partnerships and cooperation were just two priorities expressed by the government. The strategy also focused on settlement through supporting community based organizations, language services, and more efficient credential recognition processes. Ultimately, the strategy signaled a financial investment on the part of the Government of Saskatchewan as well as the goal to increase the number of nominees under the SINP.¹³⁰

The most recent policy initiative of the Saskatchewan government was the creation of the graduate student stream in November, 2010. Rob Norris, the provincial minister responsible for immigration announced the change during International Education Week in order to help “encourage more students from around the world to seize the educational opportunities in Saskatchewan.”¹³¹ The creation of the graduate student category allows Phd and Master’s students to apply for permanent residency immediately after graduation without being required to possess a post-graduate work permit. However, there is still a requirement to demonstrate the ability to be employed and settle in the province. Therefore, the graduates must meet one of the following requirements: worked in Saskatchewan for six months within field of study, have a job offer in field of study for a term longer than six months, have a spouse permanent employed in Saskatchewan, or have sufficient funds to sustain themselves for several months without employment. In addition, the applicants must have completed at least one year of study at the University of Saskatchewan or Regina and apply within two years from graduation.¹³² Within the press release it was emphasized by the Minister that international students are becoming increasingly significant to Saskatchewan and the government wanted to make it easier for them to settle in the province.¹³³ This policy action essentially allows Masters and Phd students to bypass the post-graduate work program and apply after graduating from a minimum of one year of study, but still requires them to demonstrate their viability within the Saskatchewan workforce. Thus, Saskatchewan offers two streams within the student category, the Post-Graduate Work Permit Stream and the Master’s and Phd Graduate Stream.

In the area of attraction and recruitment, the Saskatchewan government delivered on a promise from the 2009 immigration strategy and created the International Education Council in

¹³⁰ Advanced Education, Employment and Labour, *Immigration Brochure 4*.

¹³¹ Advanced Education, Employment and Immigration, "Celebrating International Education in Saskatchewan," *Government of Saskatchewan News Releases*, November 16, 2010, www.gov.sk.ca/news?newsId=21055793-0f58-474a-8d5d-310d84122bc2 (accessed January 12, 2011).

¹³² Government of Saskatchewan, *Students*, www.saskimmigrationcanada.ca/student (accessed December 14, 2011)2011.

¹³³ Advanced Education, Employment and Immigration, *Celebrating International*.

2010. During an interview Minister Norris described the need for a formalized instrument for the partnerships among stakeholders working towards common goals such as recruitment and international education. The minister stated “we had to make sure we were in a position to compliment universities and seize opportunities for synergies.” In addition, the press release stated that the council will “wrap a Saskatchewan flag around the various international endeavours being led by our educational institutions.”¹³⁴ The education council was made up of representatives from both secondary and post secondary institutions, which possess a shared interest in promoting international education. The council was intended to be an opportunity for the stakeholders to participate in discussions about strategies, best practices, and research. The idea was to bring stakeholders together to enhance Saskatchewan’s image as a destination for education.¹³⁵ The impact on policy and student flows are unknown as the council is in its infancy, however, it is another step on the part of Saskatchewan government to increase the number of international students studying in the province. In an interview Minister Norris also noted that the government would likely continue to have the avenues in place to enhance the recruitment of international students and these policy approaches were not likely to disappear anytime soon.¹³⁶

3.3 Political and Public Reaction to the Policies

During the lead up to and after the student category was created there was very little opposition within the legislature and among the public to the policy. In interviews with both federal and provincial officials, the reaction to the international student policies was described as largely positive. A Saskatchewan official stated that the questions were largely limited to policy details or projected student flows.¹³⁷ This assertion was also evidenced in Hansard when the category was created during the 2004-2005 period. For example, in the spring of 2005, then Minister Pat Atkinson provided a review of the government’s changes to SINP and included an explanation of the student category and MOU for extending the post-graduate work permit to 3 years. The comments from MLA Randy Weekes, deputy critic of immigration, were largely focused on clarification of the program and inquiries into whether government was going to ease

¹³⁴ Advanced Education Employment and Labour, "Province Increases Opportunities for International Education," *Government of Saskatchewan News Releases*, April 29, 2010, www.gov.sk.ca/news?newsId=b8f98493-34dd-4295-916f-8f455c82c8a (accessed January 12, 2011).

¹³⁵ Advanced Education Employment and Labour, "Provincial International Education Council," *Media Backgrounder* (Regina, April 29, 2010).

¹³⁶ Rob Norris, Personal Interview, 10 June 2011.

¹³⁷ AAEEI Official, Personal Interview. 17 February 2011.

the employment restrictions further to ensure students had options. Weekes emphasized the concern that because international students have a high tuition rate they needed to be able to work while studying.¹³⁸

In addition to experiencing very little opposition to the policies, there was not a strong and definable lobby effort in existence. This was highlighted by a provincial official who noted that there was not an organized student lobby for these changes to the policies in Saskatchewan. An AEEI official who has been present throughout the development of the policies, in an interview, explained that although there was not an explicit lobby on behalf of the international students, the Immigration Services division within the Saskatchewan government has collaborated with the educational institutions to deal with immigration and international student issues.¹³⁹ The general lobbying efforts of federal organizations such as Canadian Bureau for International Education and AUCC influenced the federal government which, in turn, also influenced Saskatchewan's policies and programs.

As a result of those policies and programs Saskatchewan has experienced an increase in the number of international students studying and staying in the province. As stated at the start of this chapter the number of international students studying in Saskatchewan has increased significantly over the last decade.¹⁴⁰ The number of nominations under the student category has also increased. In the year of its inception the SINP made six nominations, by 2007 the number had grown to sixty three. In 2010-11 the student category had 285 nominations, up significantly from that first year.¹⁴¹ In addition to the number of nominations increasing, Saskatchewan has also kept the average processing times for the student category under five months. This increase in student category nominations is demonstrating that the Saskatchewan government has followed through on its commitment to opening up their immigration program to international students.

¹³⁸ Government of Saskatchewan, Hansard Subject Index, 1st Session 25th Legislature 2004-05,13.

¹³⁹ AAEI Official, Personal Interview. 17 February 2011.

¹⁴⁰ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, CIC Dig Department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada, "CIC Digital Library 2008" (Ottawa: Government of Canada, 2008).

¹⁴¹ Saskatchewan Immigration Services Division, *International Students- Applications, Nominations and Processing Times* (Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2010).

3.4 Similarities and Differences Among the Provinces

Comparatively most of Canada's provincial governments have fairly similar international student policies that developed within the framework of the PNPs. New Brunswick is the only province that does not have international student stream or category. The significant differences between provinces are the degree to which employers are involved in the nomination process, whether or not the provincial governments accept applications from students who completed their studies in another Canadian province, and length of work experience requirements.

As discussed in chapter two almost all provinces have developed their version of a student category on their own timeline. Manitoba was the first province to initiate a stream to international students in their provincial nominee program. British Columbia was a close second in 2002.¹⁴² However, Alberta did not develop a stream or category dedicated to international students until 2007. Although Saskatchewan was not a leader in developing these policies it was also not the last province to pursue international students as immigrants more directly.¹⁴³

Another primary difference between most provincial programs and Saskatchewan's is the level of employer involvement. For example, in Ontario employers submit applications to the government with positions that they need filled. After the student is chosen for a position then the student submits a nominee application to the Opportunities Ontario program.¹⁴⁴ In Saskatchewan there is much less of a direct involvement of the employer.

Although most programs require applicants to possess a full time work offer, the exceptions are the Masters and Phd streams in Ontario, BC, and Saskatchewan who don't require this for their Masters and Ph.D. graduates. In Ontario, Masters and Phd students can apply for the PNP without having a full time permanent job offer.¹⁴⁵ In British Columbia students do not occupy their own category but occupy a stream under the umbrella of what is called Strategic Occupations. Similarly to the Saskatchewan program, but with small differences, Masters and Phd students who have graduated from a recognized BC post-secondary institution in the natural,

¹⁴² Ministry of Community, Aboriginal and Women's Services, "Immigration Program Reduces Critical Skills Shortage," *Government of British Columbia - News Release*, December 10, 2002, www2.news.gov.bc.ca/nrm_news_releases/2002MCAWS0073-001078.htm (accessed January 12, 2011).

¹⁴³ Government of Alberta, "Expanded Program Will Help Increase Immigration Flow," *Government of Alberta News Release*, May 22, 2007, <http://alberta.ca/home/NEwsFrame.cfm?ReleaseID=/acn/200705/21501B492DDEA-B390-5069-99fBB53DF7DC5885.html> (accessed July 25, 2011).

¹⁴⁴ Government of Ontario, *Opportunities Ontario: Provincial Nominee Program: International Student Category*, 2009, www.ontarioimmigration.ca/en/pnp/OIPNPSTUDENTS.html (accessed June 24, 2010).

¹⁴⁵ Government of Ontario, *Opportunities Ontario*.

applied or health sciences can apply for the Strategic Occupations category without a full time job offer.¹⁴⁶

The Manitoba government, like Saskatchewan, has two options for international students under their PNP. The first is for international students currently working and is called Option B under the Manitoba Provincial Nominee Program (MPNP). Under Option B students must have completed at least one year of study at a designated Canadian institution. There is not a requirement to obtain the education in Manitoba, but the six months work that is required must have been completed in Manitoba. Thus, masters students who have completed one year programs can apply for the Option B. Saskatchewan's graduate stream is different in that the students must have studied at one of the two major post-secondary institutions in the province. The second stream, introduced in 2011, is the International Student Strategic Initiative and is focused on assisting graduates in finding full-time work. The applicants must complete the employment readiness program and have completed two years of study at a designated Manitoba post-secondary education institution. The employment readiness program includes things like job readiness, career coaching, and job matching services.¹⁴⁷ This strategic initiative is considered a fast track option for students graduating without a job offer.¹⁴⁸ Within Manitoba and Saskatchewan's two streams there is one option for students studying in other provinces and a second that limits the applicants to those who have studied in their respective provinces.

In area of work-permits the provinces are similar because permits are controlled by the federal government. All provinces and the Yukon Territory have signed MOUs with the Government of Canada creating off-campus work permits for international students. For their part, the provinces are involved in approving institutions that are authorized to participate in the permit program. Each province has a list of participating institutions, so if a particular private institution is not a participating institution then the student is unable to apply for the off-campus work permit.¹⁴⁹ Thus Saskatchewan is quite similar to other provinces in the area of work permits.

¹⁴⁶ Government of British Columbia, *The British Columbia Provincial Nominee Program - Welcome BC*, www.welcombc.ca/wbc/immigration/come/work/index.page (accessed June 24, 2010).

¹⁴⁷ Government of Manitoba, "Manitoba Making it Easier for International Graduates to Stay and Work in the Province," *News Releases*, 16 2010, September, www.gov.mb.ca/chc/press/top/2010/09/2010-09-043000-9726.html (accessed January 18, 2012).

¹⁴⁸ Government of Manitoba, "International Student Invited to Stay in Manitoba," *Immigrate to Manitoba*, www2.immigratemanitoba.com/browse/howtoimmigrate/strategic/pnp-international-students.html (accessed January 18, 2012).

¹⁴⁹ Citizenship and Immigration Canada, *Studying in Canada: Work permits for students- Working off campus*, June 3, 2010, www.cic.gc.ca/english/study/work-offcampus.asp (accessed July 3, 2010).

The comparison of student flows between Saskatchewan and the other western provinces shows that, as discussed above, Saskatchewan is increasing their international student nominations within SINP however, other western provinces are still nominating more international student graduates within their PNPs. For example between 2005-2010 British Columbia nominated 916 international graduates approximately 297 more than Saskatchewan during this same time period.¹⁵⁰ Alberta nominated 127 international graduates during the fiscal year of 2009-2010. In 2011 this number increased to 160, so Alberta is also increasing their nominations. However, Alberta does not have statistics prior to 2009 to shed light on the international students in the province.¹⁵¹ Manitoba has limited statistics available declaring the number of international graduate nominations under the MPNP.

Lastly, Saskatchewan was not the first among provinces to initiate formal recruitment strategies. This is evidenced in the equivalents of Saskatchewan's newly minted International Education Council, which have existed in other provinces for almost a decade before Saskatchewan created its own council. The Manitoba Council for International Education was formed in 2000, and prior to this Manitoba had an International Education Initiative, which was a much more loosely based organization.¹⁵² British Columbia founded the Centre for International Education, which is mandated to promote BC's involvement in international projects and recruit international students to study in the province.¹⁵³

Conclusion

Provincial governments in Canada have experienced a shift in power over selection of immigrants through their PNP's, which has allowed most provinces the opportunity to ease employment and immigration restrictions on international students. The differences between provincial programs are contained largely in the details such as level of employer involvement and policy development timelines. Despite these differences in program attributes, there is still a general trend across Canadian provinces to provide a direct avenue for international students to become permanent residents. Saskatchewan has not been unique in developing international student policies related to recruitment, immigration, and employment. However, since 2004

¹⁵⁰ Tourism and Innovation Ministry of Jobs, "BC Provincial Nominee Program Evaluation Report," *Evaluation of the BC Provincial Nominee Program* (Vancouver: Government of British Columbia, 2011)15.

¹⁵¹ Bryna Sclater (Team Lead Program Analysis, Alberta Immigrant Nominee Program), "Research Question- AINP Statistics," Email to AINP Department, 16, August 2011.

¹⁵² Andrea Mahalek, "MCIE Research," Email to Manitoba Council for International Education, 10 December 2010.

¹⁵³ Karen McKellin, *Maintaining the Momentum: The Internationalization of British Columbia's Public Post Secondary Institutions*, Internationalization Research Series (Vancouver: The British Columbia Centre for International Education, 1998)1.

Saskatchewan has taken policy actions to streamline the path to permanent residency and signed agreements with the federal government to allow greater flexibility for employment. The province has also placed efforts into recruitment and attraction along with other stakeholders such as the post-secondary institutions through the Education Council. Lastly, the government created a special stream for graduate students within the student category, to ease restrictions on Ph.D. and Masters students. All of these policy steps indicate that international students have been identified by the government, as a component of the provinces efforts to stimulate and sustain economic and population growth in Saskatchewan.

Chapter 4

Conclusion

The objective in this thesis has been to explain the emergence and evolution of Saskatchewan's policy approach towards international students and the factors that shaped it. This chapter will seek to summarize the findings regarding the emergence and evolution of the policies. Secondly, it will provide a brief exploration of ethical dimensions of Saskatchewan's policy as well as comparable policies by other jurisdictions in Canada and internationally. Lastly, this chapter will profile areas for further research in the future.

4.1 Summary of the Emergence and Evolution of Saskatchewan's Policy

During the past decade international students in Saskatchewan, particularly those students who wish to stay in the province after graduation, have witnessed important policy changes. In creating the policies, the province has been influenced by its own set of political and economic factors or, if you will, interests and imperatives. The development of Saskatchewan's international student policies in immigration resulted from a rise in provincial interest and power in immigration, vis-à-vis the federal government. Alan Cairns suggests in his state-centric theory that the growth in provincial power is a result of strong provincial governments advancing their particular set of interests. In the case of Saskatchewan's approach to immigration these interests have been related primarily to population growth and economic development. When Premier Calvert commissioned the *Open Up Saskatchewan* report, the province was facing a losing battle for population due to out-migration as well as an increasing imbalance between younger and older residents that was creating a problematical dependency ratio between the former and the latter.

Since the *Open Up Saskatchewan* report, the province has introduced a series of employment and immigration initiatives for international students. The creation of the student category, in 2004, within SINP was the most significant policy step taken by the Saskatchewan government to retain international students post-graduation. In the years following the inception of the student category, a series of employment policies related to international students were established through negotiations with the federal government. Each of these policies was designed to ease employment restrictions while studying and to extend employment

opportunities for international graduates in the province. All of Saskatchewan's employment related policies were developed with the federal government through formalized memorandums of understanding and agreements. In 2008, the newly elected Saskatchewan Party government revisited the student category to ease the employment requirements that international students faced when applying for the SINP. In the area of recruitment, the Saskatchewan government's interest in promoting the province as an education destination was exemplified in 2010 with the establishment of the International Education Council. The multi-stakeholder council was intended to produce strategies to continue the internationalization of the province's educational institutions. A second example was the participation of officials from both the University of Saskatchewan and Regina in recruitment campaigns to raise the profile of Saskatchewan on the world stage as an education destination. The combination of the recruitment, employment, and immigration policies were developed to make Saskatchewan a more attractive place to study as well as present a straightforward process to finding employment after graduation.

4.2 Factors that Shaped Saskatchewan's Policies

A combination of political and economic factors motivated Saskatchewan to adopt its policy approach towards international students. As discussed in the introductory chapter of this thesis, Alan Cairn's state-centric perspective and the liberal political economy perspective have been useful in understanding the political and economic environment that Saskatchewan's policies developed within.

The state-centric perspective characterizes provinces as aggressive actors advancing their particular set of interests. All provinces, including Saskatchewan, engaged the federal government in negotiations to create their immigration agreements. Cairns described provincial governments in Canadian federalism as being focused on the preservation of jurisdictional power to use in advancing their interests.¹⁵⁴ In the case of jurisdiction over immigration, the provinces have pursued expanding their role in the selection of immigrants in order to ensure economic sustainability. For the purpose of this thesis Cairn's emphasis on the role of provincial governments in pursuing their interests, aids in understanding how Saskatchewan's policies on international students were formed through negotiations with the federal government. Without the pursuit of provincial selection programs the nominee categories for international students at

¹⁵⁴Alan C Cairns, "The Governments and Societies of Canadian Federalism," *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 10, no. 4 (1977): 702.

the provincial level would not exist. However, with the federal government also engaged in similar policy initiatives it is clear the feds were favourably predisposed to an increased provincial role in this particular component of the immigration program. This pursuit of power over immigrant selection, combined with the federal government's willingness to negotiate with the provinces, led to the bilateral federal–provincial agreements and memorandums of understanding.

The state-centric theory also emphasizes the role of governmental institutions and constitutions, which provided the framework for these agreements to ultimately come about. Constitutionally, immigration is an area of shared jurisdiction. There have been brief periods of provincial involvement, however, the federal government has largely planned and managed immigration on its own since confederation. Indeed, it was only in the period immediately after Confederation and during the last four decades that the provinces became actively involved in the field of immigration. In their efforts to achieve a balance in advancing their respective goals and objectives, the federal and provincial governments engage in negotiations that often result in formal agreements between them. Public policy initiatives are affected by these negotiations on the alignment of roles and responsibilities.¹⁵⁵ In the field of immigration a substantial amount of the negotiations have taken place on a bilateral basis and the result has been a series of intergovernmental agreements.

The political economy perspective widens the understanding of Saskatchewan's policy motivations for pursuing international students as immigrants. The political economy perspective identifies that governments do not operate in isolation or in a vacuum; instead, they operate within an environment that is impacted by various political and economic factors both domestically and internationally. Saskatchewan is not exempt from being impacted by these factors, as evidenced by the progression and timing of its international student policy. In the case of the SINP's student immigration category, there were other jurisdictions outside Canada (e.g., United Kingdom), and within Canada (e.g. Manitoba and British Columbia) that were actively involved in retaining the source of skilled labour that international graduates provided.

¹⁵⁵ Ian Peach, *Constructing Tomorrow's Federalism: New Perspectives on Canadian Governance* (Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2007)4.

Within the political economy perspective, the federated nature of the state is also important in understanding policy outcomes and political environments. In Canada, federalism has impacted the nature and timing of provincial immigration policies. Provinces learn from and compete with each other in various policy fields, including immigration. Thus when provincial government officials or politicians see their counterparts undertaking certain initiatives they devote special attention to considering whether they should do the same in ways that meet their particular goals and objectives. Howlett and Ramesh characterize the political economy as being a combination of state and market institutions. Saskatchewan's policy motivations were also the result of a combination of economic and political factors. The first set of factors includes an aging population, increasing out migration, and a small share in Canada's immigration levels. The second more political factor was that other western provinces were leading the way in negotiating intergovernmental immigration agreements; Saskatchewan followed suit to counter its demographic trend.

The federal government also does not operate in a vacuum in any policy field, including immigration. Canada is part of globalized world where human talent is the lifeblood of successful economies. The Conference Board of Canada has identified that countries need to design their immigrant selection programs based on the needs of their job market in order to be competitive economically.¹⁵⁶ Through programs such as the 'Post-graduate Work Permit' and 'Canadian Experience Class' the federal government is attempting to fill some of its skilled labour shortages and ensure economic competitiveness. In addition to retention programs, the federal government has spent significant resources to attract international students to study in Canada as evidenced through DFAIT's *Imagine* campaign. Canada is not alone in developing ambitious and aggressive international student attraction and retention policies and therefore finds itself in a competitive environment. An interview with a CIC official underscored the relevance of the Australian approach in the development of Canada's international student recruitment policies. Australia has been successful at attracting a large share of the world's international students. This amplifies the political reality that national and provincial policies in Canada related to attraction and retention of international students are heavily influenced by the

¹⁵⁶ Douglas Watt, Tim Krywulak and Kurtis Kitagawa, *Renewing Immigration: Towards a Convergence and Consolidation of Canada's Immigration Policies and Systems*, (Conference Board of Canada, 2008) Executive Summary.

policy directions of other countries as well as the need to stay competitive in a globalized economy.

With Manitoba and British Columbia leading the way, almost all the provinces have now adopted some form of a student category within their provincial nominee programs. The elements of the various provincial international student immigrations programs are fairly similar. Most provinces have a student category within their provincial nominee programs. Their differences lie in elements such as the timing of their implementation and the degree of involvement of employers. For example, Ontario has encouraged employers to submit to the government the positions they need filled. British Columbia has identified the need for skilled labour in areas of natural and applied health sciences, so the government has eased the requirements for Masters and PHD graduates in these disciplines to apply under their Strategic Occupations category. Despite these differences there are still equivalent programs in existence for retaining international students post-graduation across all but one of the provinces.

4.3 Observations of the Advantages and Disadvantages of Policies

This paper has largely focused on the benefits for Saskatchewan, Canada, and other jurisdictions for attracting and retaining international students. When evaluating the effects of the policies, however, an assessment on sending countries is also needed. For sending countries the benefits and costs are not easily quantified however, there is no doubt to their existence. The first benefit is that student mobility provides an opportunity for students to participate in tertiary education that may not be offered in their home country. Thus, students can gain the knowledge from a higher level of education without costing their home countries a large amount of money. The second benefit, linked to the first, is the transfer of technology that occurs when students study abroad. In less developed countries it is difficult to invest in centers of excellence in a particular field, however, if countries' students are able to attend these institutions internationally it provides a link for flow of technology and ideas. A study was done in the late nineties to examine technology transfers for sending countries. The study's model was that "foreign education as a process of knowledge import that contributes to economic growth in developing countries when students return with embedded human capital."¹⁵⁷ Thus, the study concluded that a higher growth rate in sending countries was associated with the number of students studying

¹⁵⁷ Karine Tremblay, "Academic Mobility and Immigration," *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 9, 2005, 196-228. 224

abroad in a developed country. A third benefit for sending countries is that, because of the language and cultural knowledge, along with other specialized skills, international students have the potential to become ambassadors of their home countries regardless of whether they work in the public or private sector. Thus, they become important agents in building stronger economic relationships between their home countries and their host countries.¹⁵⁸

There are at least two major sets of costs for sending countries. The first set consists of costs resulting from educational funds being transferred to institutions in other countries. The second set consists of costs for the sending countries resulting from a large portion of their students choosing to stay in their destination countries, thereby creating a “brain drain” and skill shortages in their countries of origin. An article exploring student mobility provides a relevant explanation covering the various aspects of the brain drain:

“A brain drain can occur if emigration of tertiary educated persons for permanent or long stays abroad reaches significant levels and is not offset by the feedback effects of remittances, technology transfer, investments or trade. Brain drain reduces economic growth through loss return on investment in education and depletion of the source country’s human capital assets.”¹⁵⁹

The precise impact on sending countries is difficult to measure and varies across jurisdictions. The source of the quote above studied the migratory decisions of international graduates in the United States illustrated that the impact of the brain drain varies by sending country. This variance makes it difficult to make assumptions or draw definitive conclusions about immigration policies targeting the attraction and retention of international students.¹⁶⁰ However, Tremblay, an academic who has explored the effects of student mobility on sending and receiving countries, suggests that when creating policies the host countries need to consider and balance the impacts of their approaches on sending countries.¹⁶¹

Lastly, when Saskatchewan is presenting its policy approaches towards international students and immigration more generally, there is always mention that any policy must take the

¹⁵⁸ Tremblay, 224-225.

¹⁵⁹ Katalin Szelenyi, "Students Without Borders? Migratory decision-making among international graduate students in the U.S.," *Knowledge, Technology & Policy* 19, no. 3 (2006): 68.

¹⁶⁰ Szelenyi, 68-70.

¹⁶¹ Tremblay, 223.

concerns of Aboriginal peoples into account. When the Calvert government was considering expanding the SINP to fill labour shortages, there was concern expressed by the Federated Saskatchewan Indian Nations (FSIN). The FSIN chief Perry Bellegarde questioned the government's plan for increased immigration when there was a large group of aboriginal youth about to become part of the workforce.¹⁶² It was predicted that over the last decade approximately 30,000 to 40,000 Aboriginal persons will enter the workforce.¹⁶³ In both the *Open Up Saskatchewan Report* and *Saskatchewan's Immigration Strategy* it was emphasized that the contributions and needs of Aboriginal Peoples will be considered in any immigration policy steps to address labour market concerns. Thus, the significance of immigration policy for Saskatchewan will likely be maintained but with consideration of the concerns of Aboriginal Peoples. It will also be accompanied with efforts to assist in improving Aboriginal Peoples participation in the labour force. The task force on Aboriginal Education and Employment is an example of these efforts. The task force is working to identify and implement solutions to current gaps in education and employment outcomes for Aboriginal Peoples in Saskatchewan.¹⁶⁴

4.4 Areas for Further Research

The purpose of this thesis has been to track and analyze the policy evolution towards international students in Saskatchewan/Canada, while providing some context through exploring the various political and economic motivations for their development. This study also provided some comparative analysis of other jurisdictions both domestically and internationally to underscore the point that Saskatchewan did not develop these policies either in isolation or in a vacuum.

More research is required both in the international and domestic context. In the comparative context it would be useful to delve deeper into the policy approaches of other jurisdictions. In the future, a fuller evaluation of the outcomes such as student flows and experiences with immigration programs would shed light on the success or failure of provinces in attracting and retaining international students. Many of the policies in question have been implemented within the last decade making an analysis the policy outcomes difficult at this time.

¹⁶² Pat Lorje, *Open up Saskatchewan*, (Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2003) 9

¹⁶³ Pavel Peykov, "Final Destination or a Stopover: Attracting Immigrants to Saskatchewan," *SIPP Briefing Note* (Saskatchewan Institute for Public Policy), no. 7 (May 2004)3.

¹⁶⁴ Advanced Education, Employment and Immigration, "Joint Task Force - Aboriginal Education and Employment," *Programs and Services*, 2011, www.aeei.gov.sk.ca/joint-task-force.ca (accessed January 12, 2012).

Within the Canadian context, some evaluative research should be undertaken of the existing policies and programs related to the attraction and retention of international students. The initiatives are relative new and it will be a few years before their effects can be evaluated in a more systematic and substantial manner. Special attention should be devoted to their effects on the attraction and retention of international students, but also the economic and social impacts of international students will have made, and the extent to which international students will have benefitted by staying in Saskatchewan regardless of whether they were educated in post-secondary institutions either in this province or any other province or territory in Canada.

Further research is also needed on policy and program development and reform initiatives related to international students in the future that would be undertaken by the provincial and federal governments in Canada. The likelihood that such policy and program initiatives will be undertaken is relatively high as the federal and provincial governments continue to advance their immigration goals through the targeting of skilled immigrants. In the fall of 2011, Canada's Immigration Minister Jason Kenney outlined his plan to rejuvenate and enhance the skill capacity of Canada's workforce through immigration. The Minister highlighted three major selection criteria priorities he hopes to implement as part of that plan, namely youth, high-quality education, and official language proficiency. International students graduating from Canadian post-secondary educational institutions generally possess all three of these elements. Given these priorities in selection criteria, the special efforts of the federal and provincial governments to attract and retain international students will likely continue and potentially become even more aggressive.¹⁶⁵ This is especially true given the recognition by the federal and provincial governments of the revenue that is generated from the presence of international students.

Concluding Thoughts

Ultimately, Saskatchewan has witnessed the growth of the international student population as well as an increase in nominations under the student category since its inception. These policies have been met with very little opposition among both legislators and the public. With Saskatchewan's ascension into the club of have provinces, its economy will most likely continue to require skilled labour, thus continuing the desirability of international students as

¹⁶⁵ Heather Scoffield, "Canadian Immigration Reform: Jason Kenney Seeks Young, Educated, Skilled and Fluent Newcomers," *Huffington Post Canada*, October 30, 2011, http://www.huffingtonpost.ca/2011/10/20/jason-kenney-reform_n_1066118.html?ref=canada-politics (accessed November 1, 2011).

immigrants. Given its aging population, a booming economy, and a skills shortage, combined with the desirable attributes of international students as immigrants, the Saskatchewan government will likely continue to pursue international students to study and to stay in the province after graduation. In the words of the current minister responsible for immigration, Rob Norris, Saskatchewan will “continue to ensure we have the instruments in place to enhance our recruitment of international students and to maximize opportunities for immigration.”¹⁶⁶ This commitment was demonstrated through the recent expansion of the Graduate Retention Program and the Gradworks Internships to include international students. These policy initiatives combined with aggressive recruitment, increased student support services on campus, immigration opportunities with short processing times demonstrate that the Saskatchewan government has and likely will continue to view international students as important for the economic future of the province.

¹⁶⁶ Rob. Norris, Personal Interview. 10 June 2011.

Appendix A: International Student Flows at the Post- secondary level in Saskatchewan between 2001-2010

	2001	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010
International Students Present	2,134	2,439	2,626	2,713	2,766	2,667	2,698	2,749	3,083	3,522

*Citizenship and Immigration Canada, *CIC Digital Library 2010*, (Ottawa: Government of Canada, 2010).

Appendix B: Saskatchewan Immigrant Nominee Program Student Category Nominations between 2004-2010

SINP Category	2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2009-09	2009-10
Student Nominations	6	11	18	63	95	140

*Saskatchewan Immigration Services Division, *International Students- Applications, Nominations and Processing Times* (Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2010).

Appendix C: Timeline of Federal-Provincial Relations in Immigration

1867 - Confederation and the constitution is developed with immigration as a shared jurisdiction with federal paramountcy.

1868 - First federal-provincial conference which resulted in the first federal-provincial agreement on immigration. This was followed by approximately six years of intergovernmental cooperation in the field of immigration.

1874 - Post War: In 1874 the federal government felt that there was competition among federal and provincial agents so the provincial role began to be limited. This continued during World War I and II there was very little involvement of the provinces in immigration. This was in part because there was reduced immigration levels during the wars.

1950's - Immigration levels began to increase after the war.

1970 - The federal government returned to a more open policy towards provincial involvement in immigration.

1971 - The Lang-Cloutier agreement was signed between Quebec and the federal government. It was the first federal-provincial agreement.

1978 - Saskatchewan signed immigration agreement with the federal government. Several other provinces also signed agreements throughout the 1970's. These agreements provided the provincial government with increased consultation with the federal government on immigration to help meet provincial labour market needs.

1998 - Saskatchewan signed a second agreement which created the pilot program for provincial nominee selection.

2005 - The latest Saskatchewan-Canada agreement on immigration was signed cementing the Saskatchewan Immigrant Nominee Program.

Appendix D: Provincial Timeline of Development of Student Categories

2001- Manitoba introduced special eligibility for international students in their nominee program. The first province to do so.

2002 - British Columbia created a student category for international students within their nominee program.

2004 - Saskatchewan created the student category within the SINP.

2007 - Ontario and Alberta created student streams within their nominee program.

Bibliography

- Abma, Derek. "Saskatchewan, Alberta to lead economic growth in 2012." *National Post-Financial Post*. December 7, 2011.
http://business.financialpost.com/2011/12/07/saskatchewan-alberta-to-lead-economic-growth-in-2012/?_lsa=3234b7ce (accessed January 12, 2012).
- Advanced Education, Employment and Immigration. "Joint Task Force - Aboriginal Education and Employment." *Programs and Services*. 2011.
www.aeei.gov.sk.ca/joint-task-force.ca (accessed January 12, 2012).
- Advanced Education Employment and Immigration. "SINP- Applications Nominations and Processing Time." Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, July 2010.
- Advanced Education Employment and Labour. "Canada-Saskatchewan Sign New Immigration Agreement." *News Release*. Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, June 2005.
- . "Changes to Immigration for International Students ." *News Release*. Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2008.
- . "International Students Can Now Work Off-Campus." *News Release*. Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2006.
- . "Province Increases Opportunities for International Education." *News Release*. Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, April 2010.
- . "Provincial International Education Council." *Media Backgrounder*. Regina, April 29, 2010.
- . "Saskatchewan Expanding Immigration Program." *News Release*. Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2004.
- . "Saskatchewan's Immigration Strategy: Strengthening our Communities and Economies." Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2009.
- Asselin, Robert B. "The Canadian Social Union: Questions About the Division of Powers and Fiscal Federalism." Ottawa: Parliamentary Information and Research Service, 2001.
- Biles, John. "Integration Policies in English-Speaking Canada." In *Immigration and Integration in Canada in the 21st Century*, by Meyer Burstein, James Frideres John Biles, edited by

- Meyer Burstein, James Frideres John Biles. Kingston: School of Policy Studies, Queen's University, 2008.
- Birchard, Karen. "Canadian Universities See Big Jump in Foreign Student Enrollments." *Chronicle of Higher Education* 56, no. 8. 2009.
- Bradshaw, James. "University leaders woo students in India." *The Globe and Mail*. November 6, 2010.
- Cairns, Alan C. "The Governments and Societies of Canadian Federalism." *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 10, no. 4 (1977): 695-725.
- Cameron, Arla. "Saskatchewan: Sustaining Economic Momentum Through Immigration." *Metropolis: Our Diverse Cities - The Prairies*, 2009: 37-40.
- Cameron, James D. "International Student Integration Into the Canadian University: Post World War Two Historical Case Study." *History of Intellectual Culture* 6, no. 1 (2006): 18.
- Canada, Citizenship and Immigration. *Backgrounder - Highlights of Canada-Ontario Immigration Agreement*. 2005.
www.cic.gc.ca/English/departement/media/backgrounders/2005/2005-11-21 (accessed November 12, 2010).
- . *Backgrounder- Canada-Saskatchewan Immigration Agreement*. 2005.
www.cic.gc.ca/English/departement/media/backgrounders/2005-06-01.asp (accessed November 12, 2010).
- Canadian Bureau for International Education. *Canada First: A 2009 Survey of International Students*. Survey, Ottawa: CBIE, 2009.
- . *Northern Lights: International Graduates of Canadian Institutions and the National Workforce*. Ottawa: CBIE, 2007.
- . *The National Report on International Students in Canada*. Ottawa: CBIE, 2005.
- Chui, Tina. "International Students In Canada." *Education Quarterly Review* (Statistics Canada) 3, no. 3 (1996).
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. *Annual Report to Parliament on Immigration*. Ottawa: Minister of Public Works and Government Services Canada, 2009.
- . "Backgrounders-Changes to Federal Skilled worker and Investor Immigration Programs." June 26, 2010. www.cic.gc.ca/english/departement/media/backgrounders/2010-06-26c.asp#tphp%20idtphp (accessed July 3, 2010).
- . "Canada and Saskatchewan Announce a Pilot Project for Foreign Students." *News Release*. Ottawa: Government of Canada, 2004.

- . "Canada and Saskatchewan announce pilot project for foreign students." *News Release*. Ottawa, May 6, 2004.
- . "Canada-Saskatchewan Immigration Agreement." Ottawa: Government of Canada, 2005.
- . *CIC Digital Library 2010*. Ottawa: Government of Canada, 2010.
- . "Dual Intent." *Studying in Canada: Study Permits*. 2008.
www.cic.gc.ca/english/study/institutions/intent.asp (accessed January 13, 2012).
- . "Study in Canada: Visas, Work and Immigration for International Students." Ottawa: Minister of Public Works and Government Services Canada, 2009.
- . *Studying in Canada: A Guide for Foreign Students*. Ottawa: Minister of Public Works and Government Services, 2004.
- . *Studying in Canada: Work Permit for students-Working after graduation*. December 15, 2009. <http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/study/work-postgrad.asp> (accessed May 4, 2010).
- . *Studying in Canada: Work permits for students- Working off campus*. June 3, 2010.
www.cic.gc.ca/english/study/work-offcampus.asp (accessed July 3, 2010).
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada-Research and Evaluation Branch. "Evaluation of the International Student Program." Ottawa: Government of Canada, July 2010.
- Council of Ministers of Education Canada. *Imagine Education au/in Canada - Brand Use Guidelines: Home*. June 2010. www.imagine.cmec.ca/en/ (accessed July 2010).
- Council on Foreign Relations. "U.S. Immigration Policy." Independent Task Force Report No.63, New York, 2010.
- . "U.S. Immigration Policy." *Independent Task Force Report N0.63*. New York: Council of Foreign Relations, 2009.
- Council, The British. *Overview of PMI2 - The Prime Minister's Initiative for International Education-Education UK Marketing- British Council*.
<http://www.britishcouncil.org/eumd-pmi2-overview.htm> (accessed Jan 2011).
- Courchene, Thomas J. *A State of Minds: Toward a Human Capital Future for Canadians*. Montreal: Insitute for Research in Public Policy, 2001.
- Courchene, Thomas. "The Comparative Nature of Australian and Canadian Economic Space." In *Reforming Fiscal Federalism for Global Competition*, by Paul Boothe, 7-21. Edmonton: The University of Alberta Press, 1996.

- Cunningham, Christopher G. *The Integration of International Students on Canadian Post-Secondary Campuses*. Canadian Bureau for International Education, 1991. Vol. 2. no. 1.
- Department of Citizenship and Immigration Canada. "CIC Digital Library 2008." Ottawa: Government of Canada, 2008.
- Department of Citizenship and Immigration. "Students and General Skilled Migration." www.immi.gov.au/students/students-gsm.htm (accessed July 2, 2010).
- Department of Immigration and Citizenship . "Graduate Skilled Temporary Visas." 2010. www.immi.gov.au/allforms/pdf/1187i.pdf (accessed July 2, 2010).
- Department of Immigration and Citizenship. "Australian General Skilled Migration Booklet." 2010. www.immi.gov.au/allforms/booklets/1119.pdf (accessed July 2, 2010).
- . *Student Visa Assessment Levels*. www.immi.gov.au/students/student-visa-assessment-levels.htm (accessed May 22, 2010).
- Diambomba, Miala. *Economic Impact of International Students in Canada*. Canadian Bureau for International Education, 1993.
- Diambomba, Miala. *Economic impact of international students in Canada: Exploratory cost-benefit analysis*. CBIE Research Report no.5, Canadian Bureau for International Education, 1993.
- Federation of Canadian Municipalities. "Addressing the Fiscal Imbalance in Canada's cities today." *Out Cities, Our Future*. Ottawa, June 2006.
- Foreign Affairs and International Trade Canada. *Economic Impact of International Education In Canada*. February 2010. www.international.gc.ca/education/impact/asp.aspx (accessed June 2010).
- George Tillman Consulting. *Canadian Programs and Policies Affecting International Students*. Background Report, Ottawa: Department of the Secretary of State of Canada, 1990.
- Gerald Baier, Herman Bakvis. "Federalism and the Reform of Central Institutions: Dealing with Asymmetry and the Democratic Deficit." In *Constructing Tomorrows Federalism: New Perspectives on Canadian Governance*, by Ian Peach. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2007.
- Government of Alberta. "Expanded Program Will Help Increase Immigration Flow." *News Release*. Edmonton, May 22, 2007.
- Government of British Columbia. *The British Columbia Provincial Nominee Program - Welcome BC*. www.welcombc.ca/wbc/immigration/come/work/index.page (accessed June 24, 2010).

- Government of Manitoba. *International Students/Immigrate to Manitoba*.
www2.immigratemanitoba.com/browse/howtoimmigrate/pnp/pnp-students.html
 (accessed June 15, 2010).
- . "News Releases." *Province of Manitoba*. June 25, 2010.
<http://www.gov.mb.ca/chc/press/top/2010/06/2010-06-25-08700-9029.html> (accessed
 November 11, 2010).
- Government of Ontario. *Opportunities Ontario: Provincial Nominee Program: International Student Category*. 2009. www.ontarioimmigration.ca/en/pnp/OIPNPSTUDENTS.html
 (accessed June 24, 2010).
- Government of Saskatchewan. "Canada and Saskatchewan Sign Immigration Agreement."
Government of Saskatchewan. March 16, 1998.
<http://www.gov.sk/news?newsId=38061a88-4c76-45f6-9e09-3e0c316b112d> (accessed
 November 13, 2010).
- . "Canada and Saskatchewan Sign New Immigration Agreement." *News Releases*. Regina,
 June 1, 2005.
- John W.P. Veugelers, Thomas R Klassen. "Canadian Immigration Policy: A reply to Foot and
 Simmons." *The Canadian Journal of Sociology* 19, no. 4 (1994): 535-540.
- Kent, Peter. "Address by Minister of State Kent at Conference of the Americas on International
 Education." *Conference of the Americas on International Education*. Calgary: Foreign
 Affairs and International Trade Canada, October 22, 2010.
- King, Russell, and Enric Ruiz-Gelices. "International Student Migration and the European Year
 Abroad." *International Journal of Population Geography*, 2003: 229-252.
- Kostov, Chris. "Canada-Quebec Immigration Agreements(1971-1991) and Their Impact on
 Federalism." *The American Review of Canadian Studies* 31, no. 1 (2008): 91-103.
- Leason, Howard. In *Canada: The State of the Federation 2002: Reconsidering the Institutions of
 Canadian Federalism*, by Peter J. Meekson.
- Leo, Christopher, and Martine August. "The Multilevel Governance of Immigration and
 Settlement: Making Deep Federalism Work." *Canadian Journal of Political Science* 42,
 no. 2 (June 2009).
- Li, Peter S. *Destinationa Canada: Immigration Debates and Issues*. Toronto: Oxford Press,
 2003.
- Liesbet Hooghe, Gary Marks. "Uraveling the Central State, But How? Types of Multi-Level
 Governance." *Poltical Science Series*. no. 87. Insitute for Advanced Studies, March 2001.

- Literacy, Department of Advanced Education and. *Tuition and Fees*.
<http://www.gov.mb.ca/ie/study/tuition.html> (accessed November 11, 2010).
- Lorje, Pat. *Open up Saskatchewan*. Government of Saskatchewan, 2003.
- Luedtke, Adam. "Citizenship, Economics, and Immigration in a Federal Polity: Evidence from Canada and the EU." *Centre d'etudes canadiennes*. University of Washington , December 2004.
- Manitoba Labour and Immigration. *Manitoba Immigration Facts: 2009 Statistical Report*. Winnipeg: Government of Manitoba, 2009.
- Marginson, Simon. "Global Position and Position Taking: The Case of Australia." *Journal of Studies in International Education* (Association of Studies in International Education) 11, no. 5 (2007): 5-32.
- McBride, Karen. *A Warm Welcome? Recruitment and Admission of International Students to Canadian Universities: Policies, Procedures and Capacity*. Case Studies, Ottawa: Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada, 1998.
- McKellin, Karen. *Maintaining the Momentum: The Internationalization of British Columbia's Public Post Secondary Institutions*. Internationalization Research Series, Vancouver: The British Columbia Centre for International Education, 1998.
- Meekison, Peter J. *Canada: The State of the Federation 2002: Reconsidering the Institutions of Canadian Federalism*. Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2004.
- Ministry of Community, Aboriginal and Women's Services. "Immigration Program Reduces Critical Skills Shortage." *News Release*. Government of British Columbia, December 2002.
- Peach, Ian. *Constructing Tomorrows Federalism: New Perspectives on Canadian Governance*. Winnipeg: University of Manitoba Press, 2007.
- Peykov, Pavel. "Final Destination or a Stopover: Attracting Immigrants to Saskatchewan." *SIPP Briefing Note* (Saskatchewan Institute for Public Policy), no. 7 (May 2004).
- Peykov, Pavel. *Immigrant Skilled Workers: Should Canada Attract More Foreign Students?* Public Policy Paper, University of Regina, The Saskatchewan Institute of Public Policy, 2004.
- Ramesh, Michael Howlett and M. *The Political Economy of Canada*. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart Inc, 1992.
- Saskatchewan Immigration Services Division. *International Students- Applications*.

- Nominations and Processing Times*. Regina: Government of Saskatchewan, 2010.
- Scofield, Heather. "Canadian Immigration Reform: Jason Kenney Seeks Young, Educated, Skilled and Fluent Newcomers." *Huffington Post Canada*. October 30, 2011. http://www.huffingtonpost.ca/2011/10/20/jason-kenney-reform_n_1066118.html?ref=canada-politics (accessed November 1, 2011).
- Smiley, Donald. "Federal States and Federal Societies with Special Reference to Canada." *International Political Science Review* (International Political Science Association) 5, no. 4 (1984): 443-454.
- Spiro, Peter. "Federalism and Immigration: models and trends." *International Social Science Journal* 53, no. 167 (2001): 67-73.
- Statistics Canada. "Proportion of Foreign Born, Canada, provinces and territories." *Ethnic Diversity and Immigration*. Ottawa, 1991, 1996, 2001.
- Szelenyi, Katalin. "Students Without Borders?" *Knowledge, Technology & Policy*, 2008.
- The Association of Universities and Colleges in Canada. "Trends in Higher Education Volume 1 Enrolment." Vol. 1. Ottawa, Alberta: AUCC, 2011.
- Thorlakson, Lori. "Government Building and Political Development in Federations: Applying Canadian theory to the German Case." *Regional and Federal Studies* 10, no. 3 (2000): 129-148.
- Tourism and Innovation Ministry of Jobs. "BC Provincial Nominee Program Evaluation Report." *Evaluation of the BC Provincial Nominee Program*. Vancouver: Government of British Columbia, 2011.
- Tremblay, Karine. "Academic Mobility and Immigration." *Journal of Studies in International Education* (Association for Studies in International Education) 9 (2005): 196-228.
- U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. *USCIS- Application for Employment Authorization*. June 18, 2010. www.uscis.gov (accessed June 2010).
- . *USCIS- Questions and Answers: Extension of Optional Practical Training Program for Qualified Students*. www.uscis.gov (accessed June 2010).
- U.S. Department of State. "Student Visas." *Travel.State. Gov*. http://travel.state.gov/visa/temp/types/types_1268.html (accessed June 2010).
- University Health Insurance Plan. *UHIP - Premium Table*. http://www.uhip.ca/_uploads/en_PremiumTable.htm (accessed November 12, 2010).

- University of Saskatchewan. *Tuition - University of Saskatchewan*. 1 2010, November. <http://students.usask.ca/current/paying/tuition.php> (accessed November 11, 2010).
- Vineberg, R.A. "Federal-provincial relations in Canadian immigration." *Canadian Public Administration* 30, no. 20 (1987): 299-317.
- Vries, John de, and Stephen Richer. *The 1988 Survey of International Students in Canadian Universities*. Ottawa: Department of the Secretary of State of Canada, 1988.
- Watt, Douglas, Tim Krywulak, and Kurtis Kitagawa. *Renewing Immigration: Towards a Convergence and Consolidation of Canada's Immigration Policies and Systems*. Conference Board of Canada, 2008.
- Young, Margaret. "Immigration: The Canada-Quebec Accord(BP-252E)." *Government of Canada -Depository Services Program*. March 1991. <http://dsp-psd.pwgsc.gc.ca/Collection-R/LoPBdP/BP/bp252-e.htm> (accessed November 16, 2010).